

**RESEARCH PAPER**

## **Effectiveness of NAB's Anti-Corruption Strategies Under the PML-N Government (2013-2018)**

**1Laiba Nadeem, 2Aleeza and 3Arooj Nasir**

1. MS Scholar, Department of Politics & IR, GC Women University Sialkot, Punjab, Pakistan
2. MS Scholar, Department of Politics & IR, GC Women University Sialkot, Punjab, Pakistan
3. MS Scholar, Department of Politics & IR, GC Women University Sialkot, Punjab, Pakistan

**Corresponding Author**

laiibaanadeem@gmail.com

**ABSTRACT**

The objective of the study to analyze the role of NAB to combat corruption in Pakistan during PML-N government in 2013-2018. Pakistan is a developing country. Since independence, Pakistan is facing with its economic issue. The main reason for economic instability is corruption. This study reveals how corruption harms the economic condition of the country. NAB is an anti-corruption organization that works to combat corruption. Anti-corruption organizations, mainly NAB, are working to combat and minimize diseases from society. This study analyzes the functioning and challenges faced by NAB by means of a descriptive, analytical, and historical approach. This study employed qualitative research methodology. How can corruption be controlled by this institution. This study analyzed the NAB strategies that were beneficiary for measurable outcomes or remained silent due to political influence and institutional weakness during 2013 to 2018. There are many reasons for corruption but the lack of awareness about rules, laws and rights that are mentioned in constitution, and no one considers corruption is the violation of constitution as well as unethical.

**Keywords:** Democratic Accountability (2013-2018), Anti Corruption Strategies, Political Corruption and governance, Governance and institutional Effectiveness, National Accountability Bureau (NAB)

**Introduction**

The main objective of the country is to give life to its citizen that free from poverty, instability, economy crisis, injustice, cruelty. But these basic rights are damaged in Pakistan due to the corruption. The National Bureau (NAB) established in 1999, its role to make corruption free governance. It was a primary anti-corruption body, expected to perform independently and counter corruption. This gap focuses on NAB performance, functions, strategies, and its real effectiveness on counter corruption. The existing studies focus on isolated cases or in political narrative and not cover the overall performance of NAB's during the specific era. Study this gap to understand the NAB's worked genuinely to accountability institution.

The National Bureau reflected its key role in the 2013 to 2018 era because of its efforts to counter corruption. The NAB faced criticism only targeting opposition. This era marked significant in political and judicial development because of the efforts increase in this time. particularly under Justice (Ret) "Javed Iqbal" as chairman from 2017 onward.

This article aims to examine corruption impact on society and political as well as on economy, this article analyzes the prevalence of corruption in public and private institutions like judiciary, police sector, media education, administrative and government institution, healthcare and public sector enterprises. This study expects to explore what corruption is, its forms in which it exists in society, and causes behind the evolution of corruption. On the

other hand, this study will describe how government and anti-corruption institutions try to stop this disease from the country reports.

## **Literature Review**

Pakistan is a developing country. Pakistan deals with numerous challenges from the day of its autonomy 1947. Poverty spreads quickly day by day in all communities because of corruption. In across the globe corruption is the leading catalyst of poverty. Corruption effects mostly middle and poor class compared to rich class. The upper class sometimes even benefits from corruption practices, less effected while the middle and lower classes suffer the most. Theft, kickbacks, and bribery favoritism are embedded in corruption. Corruption arises when a government officials misuse his power and authority for his personal gain. Corruption arises in the public or private sector or even in non-governmental organizations. Corruption is a significant hazard for developing countries with the forward motion of a person's responsiveness. (waqas,2023)

Corruption has deeply penetrated in every sector, department. Corruption is deeply rooted with corruption reaching every organ of the state including judiciary, legislature and as well as executive. (UMBREEN, 2010).

Citizens are fed up with corrupt politicians and bureaucrats because the life of law abiding and honest citizens has become miserable. Corruption has become largely unchecked and uncontrolled, creating difficulties for honest citizens to face injustice, delays, and exploitation in their daily life. Corruption can be seen in every sector, institution either public or private. (Rabbani, 2005).

Corruption refers to dishonest conduct by those who misuse their power or authority for their personal gain. Corruption arises when the power is misused for personal benefits rather than being exercised for the public good. Corruption defines as gaining private interests, misuse of power, and not fulfilling official duties. (Naab, 2016).

To find the historical evolution of corruption in Pakistan there is need to study two major events; world war and mass migration. World War 2 led to the increase in ownership leading to establishment of first Anti-corruption Agency in subcontinent, as "special police Establishment". As we know Pakistan emerged on map of the world that had fragile economy, structural weakness, insufficient political leadership, inexperienced politicians but Pakistan inherited professional civil service. Due to the lack of untrained political leader's civil servants filled the vacuumed by taking over the governance. They run ministries as well as took over posts of Prime Ministers, Governor-General and President. (MUNIR,2002)

To control and prevent corruption, NAB made efforts through companying on various platforms, such as Director General of National Accountability Bureau played visit to Quaid-e-Azam university to increase awareness among students on 31 May,2016. In this campaign, Aliya Rashid, the Director General of NAB, discussed the types and forms of corruption in which it exists in society damaging the socio-economic development of the country. She also mentioned Quaid-e-Azam words that corruption is poisonous and we must fight with it with our own hands. She raised awareness of her slogan "say No to Corruption". (NAB,2016)

Project for improvement in reporting and auditing program has been introduced to improve consistency between human and fiscal resources, ensuring greater transparency and accountability, ensuring empowerment, boosting productivity and performance in judicial and police department. New Police Order 2002 was re-organized, also it aims was to analyses carefully whether changes have been brought in administration at union, Tehsil, district and divisional level in regard of fairness, efficiency and transparency. The chief

justice of Pakistan is making efforts to put the judicial system on the right track with the aim of eradicating corrupt practices. (hasan,2023)

Poor governance led to enhancing corruption in the appearance of bribery, extortion, nepotism, swindling, and kickbacks. It reduces the efficiency rate of any economy, reduces Direct Foreign Investment, and reduces government resources. Due to unawareness, soft forgiving culture, impartiality of judiciary and lack of law and order, Pakistan is unable to tackle the mixable disease like corruption from the economic, social, religious, defense and political sectors. It's not possible to search for every rotten apple and punish them by criminal laws, but at least there is a need to punish highly visible corrupt officials. To insure accountability and transparency there is need to make reforms by Anti-corruption laws, many changes should be made such as, accountability on the top should be insured, National Anti-Corruption should be given more powers so that it can act as a watch dog on public, private and governmental officials, use independent private and public sector auditor, awarding people by evaluating corrupt system, illicit money and property transactions should be managed at par with drug money, requiring public as well as private officials to declare their assets, poverty alleviation and introducing beneficial economic reforms, community engagement and student's participation should be insured and shaping public opinion. Public opinion should be built which is only possible by spreading education which declines corruption either morally or legally. The elements of good governance are crucial for the development of any country's economy.(Asif Ali, 2016)

Corruption can be called a worldwide pandemic as it can be seen in every region of state. The International-Anti-Corruption-Organization, Transparency International (IT) point out corruption as one of the biggest, troubled and important and highlighted challenge in the third world countries as it damages essence of democracy, rule of law, loss of public trust in political processes and its leaders, loss faith in political parties, weakens institutions by undermining state's legitimacy. (Dr. Muhammad Imran D. G.,2023)

Corruption Perception Index by Transparency International, ranked 13 out of 99 numbers in 1990, 42 out of 133 in 2003 and 47 out of 180 countries. On the other hand, Pakistan placed in 139th on ground of corruption free governance. Corruption is a determined difficulty throughout the world, specifically in expanding countries. It has adverse and damaging consequences on the operating of management institutions and the distribution of public facilities and can compromise masses confidence in management (Saleh Nawaz Khan, 2023)

For last year's there is a loophole at the national level. To wipe out this jeopardy, there is a need for host benchmarks. The realization in the wide-ranging communal and disclosure of a mighty civil civilization, obstreperous media and a lately autonomous magistrates all by themselves symbolize insurance to the victory of any future programmed of transparency. It provides a historical background for corruption. NAB is playing a significant role in ending corruption from the root level. To wage war against corruption, many organizations have been established since independence. Pakistan prior organization established to eliminate and crush corruption was the "Ehtesaab Cell" established by the November 1996 Ehtesaab Ordinance which was operated under second tenure of Prime Minister "Nawaz Sharif". (Ali, Anti-corruption Institutions and Governmental, 2021)

The Corruption Perception Index (CPI) measures how much a country corrupts and ranks the country. The scale starts from 0 to 100, the 0 shows the worst image of corruption in country and on the opposite side the 100 indicates the very clear image, free from corruption. In 2020, Pakistan got score 31 and ranked 124<sup>th</sup> position out of 180countries. Later, according to Transparency International, Pakistan's CPI, fell from 31 to 28 score and got 140<sup>th</sup> position at globally. During the PTI government the Pakistan score changed over years. In 2019, Pakistan got ranked 120<sup>th</sup> position. In 2020, Pakistan fell to 124<sup>th</sup> position.

Additionally, in 2021 Pakistan ranked at 140<sup>th</sup> position. In PML-N government in 2018, the Pakistan secured 117<sup>th</sup> position out of 180 countries. (Ahmed A., 2022)

To combat corruption, there is a crucial goal to target individuals' personal outlook, need to replace a money-centered outlook with a value-based code of life, to persuade people that money is a means to fulfill needs, and not the goal. The fundamental issue of every man for himself needs to be swapped with concerns for the country. In other words, there is a need to substitute money with knowledge as the primary goals of society. (Badar, 2017)

This study analyzes that sustained awareness campaigns are indispensable for eliminating corruption from a basic level. Prosperity in the economy is only possible when society is free of corruption. So many reasons exist for which corruption exists in society, most notably reasons are lack of accountability and weak judicial system in the country. In many cases, either corrupt individuals are not exposed, or they manage to evade punishment by using their power, position, and influence over institutions who are supposed to fight against corruption (Pandhi 2022)

## **Material and Methods**

In this research, the qualitative method was used. Qualitative methods used to explore the forms and impact on society of corruption. qualitative method with descriptive, Historical and Analytical approach has been used in this study to explore the major cases investigated by NAB during 2013-2018, such as Panama Paper Case, Hudaibiya Paper Mills Case. This study relies on secondary data which involves official documents, official websites, and articles. To approach data, the main source was the internet.

## **Results and discussion**

### **Challenges**

In contemporary political discourse, the public has been monitoring the National Accountability Bureau (NAB), an anti-corruption agency established to investigate issues pertaining to the corruption of municipal office holders. The NAB Ordinance's original purpose is the source of its first problem. The foundation was established during General Pervez Musharraf's military rule through an ordinance approved in 1999 that prioritized victimization and self-verification over keeping dishonest officials accountable. The National Accountability Bureau (NB) in Pakistan faces significant challenges, including political interference, lack of institutional autonomy, and concerns about human rights abuses, hindering its effectiveness in combating corruption. Since its establishment NAB has been facing various challenges such as;

Political influence over NAB has a critical challenge faced by NAB as the agency's operations are activated and motivated politically which targets the party in opposition rather than addressing the corrupt system. Another challenge facing by NAB is lack of Independence. It is seen that NAB has been subjected to political control and influence.

The Weak institutional framework of NAB is a serious challenge faced by NAB with Human Rights Concerns as there are allegations of human rights abuse by NAB which include torture, unlawful detention of official and public holders during investigation. Lack of free trials is another issue facing NAB, with some arguing that individuals are not afforded due process and are denied access to legal representation.

Lack of transparency of NAB's operations is another challenge which makes it difficult to hold public officials accountable. NAB cases often rely on weak evidence, with some evidence allegedly obtained through torture or coercion. The legal process is slow,

with cases taking years to be resolved, leading to a lack of justice and undermining the NAB's credibility.

## Forms and Kinds

Any activity that results in the rewards of a powerful entity at the expense of others is considered corruption. It is therefore analyzed as an abuse of authority. When someone in a position of authority uses their influence-to-influence choices or engages in any other dishonest or fake behavior, such as accepting or offering bribes or inappropriate gifts, conspiring to influence elections, rerouting funds, laundering money, or misleading sponsors, it is called corruption. (Chen, 2023)

The very first form in which corruption prevails in society is "Bribery". It can be defined as accepting something in exchange for something. Bribery is the receiving of money or kind in return of giving some kind of favor under the table. The second form is the "Embezzlement" which means misplacing, stealing and misusing or theft of funds and resources by public officials. The public officials loot resources and wealth through public institutions in which they are employed to maximize their power, secure their position, and sustain their wealth. It is also called financial fraud conducted by a person assigned with someone else's money. The third form is "fraud", a violation that encompasses trickery, swindle or trickery used by ruling elite or cluster to make more advantages. Fraud is defrauding someone for personal benefit. Financial, tax, insurance, and investment fraud are just a few of the many patterns in which it can occur. The Forth form of corruption is "Extortion", which is the extraction of resources or money by means of force, violence or threat. The mafia or blackmailers extort money from citizens, private businesses and public officials by harassing them to gain money and other advantages in return for their kind of peace. Kickbacks are another form of corruption which involves giving or receiving gifts, cash or other benefits to secure any favor mostly use to manipulate authorities to grant contracts leading to unequal opportunities. The sixth form in which corruption exists is "Favoritism and Nepotism". Nepotism is favoring the family members, closed or friends by granting those positions, authority, power or any favor that they do not qualify is called nepotism. The seventh from is Grease payment. A grease payment, or facilitation payment, is a payment to an alien official to rush into a routine duty, such as processing papers or circulating licenses and permits. Finally, one is the "Money Laundering" which is the process of turning black money or illegal money into white or making it come from legal means.

## Causes and Impacts on Society

Numerous laws have the potential to punish corruption, but due to a lack of reforms and political devotion, no corruption giant has been punished to date. Among these, corruption is accepted as usual by both the victim and the mistreated. While one uses it as a stimulus, the other gives it a contract fee, which saves time and prevents a person from making routine trips. (Tariq, 2022)

Using the idea previously mentioned, the following corruption equation can be formulated;

$$C = R + D - A$$

The equation uses the letters C, R, D, and A to represent accountability, economic rent, corruption, and discretionary choice, respectively. According to the formula, the more opportunities a country has for economic rent (R), the more corrupt it will be. Administrators are also more likely to be corrupt with the more discretionary powers they are given.

**Low wages:** The greater the wage level, the less the corruption level and the opposite also apply. Rose-Ackerman prominently says that in countries where law enforcement officials are not contracted with satisfactory income and income, the law enforcement force engages in corrupt exchange for livelihood.

**Poverty:** Widespread poverty and income inequality create an environment where individuals may feel compelled to engage in corrupt activities to survive and improve their socio-economic status. The difficulty of insufficiency in immature courtiers grows more subtle; the more administrative funds are diverted from community goods like education and physical health. Deficits in institutional capacity and economic growth can, of course, occur in both directions, and corruption may be exacerbated by resource scarcity.

**Quality of Bureaucracy:** the quality of bureaucracy indirectly causes corruption in any country as in some public sector jobs have more privileges and status. In 1997, Rauch and Evans examined that civil-servant recruitment, and promotions are not mostly based on recruitment; the higher the extinction of corruption is.

## CPI

Year	Pakistan's Rank	score
2013	127	28
2014	126	29
2015	117	30
2016	116	32
2017	117	32
2018	117	33
2024	135	27

Source: CPI: Transparency International the Global Coalition against Corruption

## Cases Investigated in 2013-2018

NAB has investigated many cases during 2013-2018 which included many politicians, corruption cases, and land grabs. 129 cases were closed by NAB against politicians in which 12 were related to Sharif Family. The amount of corruption references cases recorded by NAB in 2014 was more than 2013 which were 208 and 135 respectively.

## Panama Papers Case

The Panama case has been most publicized and disclosed case in the history of Pakistan. The Panama case is also known as Panama-gate case of 2017 officially titled by Imran Khan vs Nawaz Sharif which made ineligibility of Ex Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif from holding the office. On 3 April, secret document of 11.5 million were publicized by the International Consortium of Investigative Journalists, also called as Panama papers. These documents were sourced from Panamanian Law firm which included the point out of eight foreign companies owned by Nawaz Sharif then in-office Prime Minister of Pakistan and in-office Chief Minister of Punjab, Shehbaz Sharif. ICIJ reported that the children of Sharif, Maryam, Hassan and Hussain were authorized to make transactions for these companies mainly four companies; Nescol Limited, Nielson Holding Limited, Coomber Group and Hangon Property Holding Limited which took possession of elegance property ate in London from 2006-2007 and was guaranteed for loan up to 13.8\$ million and ruling government started to face huge criticism and Imran Khan said" The Leaks are sent by God". (Cheema,2018)

Due to this criticism, Sharif proclaimed the creation of Judicial Committee under Judges of Supreme Court, but all the retired judges refused to form the commission on 5

April 2016. As a result Sharif while addressing the National Assembly on 16 May, 2016, recommended to form a joint committee for establishment of Judicial Commission by saying that he is not afraid of accountability, He claimed that those who live in bungalows and fly around in helicopters are accusing me of mistreating them. He asked if they could explain to the country how they made all this money and how much tax they give the government. He reiterated that the apartments were purchased using proceeds from the sale of his father's Jeddah Steel Mill. He said before coming into politics and very before formation of his party, we were well established industrial family. He also said that Maryam Nawaz is also independent women and she is not official owner of those offshore companies but just a trustee. In response to this address, the opposition party of Imran Khan (Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf) filed a formally request against Nawaz Sharif in Supreme Court of Pakistan to disqualify as Prime Minister on 29 August 2016. Many MPs who targeted Sharif's children, son-in-law Muhammad Safdar, brother-in-law, and then-finance minister Ishaq Dar also backed this petition. The private residence at Rajwind, close to Lahore, was the site of a sit-in by PTI supporters on September 30, 2016. Eventually, Imran Khan ordered the supporter to leave the capital, "Islamabad," and remanded Nawaz Sharif to comply or appear in person for additional accountability. (Alecci, 2018)

To improve heaviness on the government, Imran Khan questioned the Supreme Court held an initial appeal for disqualifying Prime Minister, which was headed by Chief Justice Jamali. The hearing began on 1 November 2016. Sharif's family was legally counselled by senior attorney Salman Aslam Butt and Akram Sheikh in which they testified that the Sharif's family has been running the business lawfully for decades and all the money is lawfully earned. The court also asked the PTI to present quality evidence. On 14 Nov 2016, Sharif's lawyer made a letter printed by "Hamad Bin Jasim" the PM of Qatar from 2007-2013. In the letter it was stated that Hamad's father "Jassim Bin Jabr Al Thani" has established commerce dealings with Nawaz Sharif coordinated by Hamad's eldest brother and expressed Sharif's desire to invest in real estate business of Thani family in Qatar" these documents completely changed the public stand for PM. As a result, new and fresh hearings restarted on 4 January 2017 with the rebuilding bench. (Sikander, 2016)

### **Hudaibiya Paper Mills Case**

Hudaibiya Paper Case is bigger than the Panama Paper case said by information minister Chaudhary Fawad Hussain as this case involved fraud of 1242 million rupees initiated in 2000 when NAB filed a reference against Hudaibiya Paper Private Limited. He said that Sharif's family is the major character of this case and former finance minister Ishaq Dar assisted them by opening fake foreign currency accounts as he was the certify in the case. According to Fawad Hussain, investigation of the record of Hudaibiya Paper unveiled to NAB investigators that 30.499 million were shown as share deposit money in 1996-1997 and 612.273 million rupees appeared in 1997-1998. After which severe doubts raised about the influx of money in company due to which NAB initiated investigation under NAB Ordinance 1999. (Hussain,2021)

In case of Panama Paper Case only Nawaz Sharif, Maryam Sharif, Muhammad Safdar, Hassan and Hussain were accused but in case of Hudaibiya Paper Mill, then chief minister Shehbaz Sharif and his successor Hamza Sharif are also held accused of wrongdoing giving new dimensions to the accountability process of Sharif's family. NAB initiated investigation, but the accused failed to tell the legal revenue streams. NAB held that the accused were benefiting themselves from these slush funds by obtaining Pak Rupees credit lines. To prevent investigation and producing legitimacy of these funds they decided to transfer the money from fake foreign currency accounts directly to Hudaibiya Paper's Mill. (HUSSAIN, 2017)

In 2021, PTI, ruling federal government announced to hold fresh investigation into Hudaibiya Paper Mills case which was closed in 2017 by the order of Supreme Court which

confirmed the Sharif's family guiltless. For re-examination of case, the government asked the relevant departments to reinvestigate the case in which the Nawaz Sharif and Shehbaz Sharif were held main accused. Fawad Chaudhary revealed in his tweet that the way money was laundered by Sharif family was replicated by the Sharif's in other cases as well. In Prime Minister Imran khan's meeting, team gave the premier a detail about the reference case filled by NAB in 2000 for misappropriating 1.24 billion rupees through mills also the NAB did not challenge the decision of LHC, in September 2017, NAB finally appealed to challenge the decision of LHC in Supreme Court which was rejected by SC on 15 December, 2017. After that, NAB again filed a reconsider formal request which was also rejected by the three-judge bench on 30 October 2018 due to which government decided to hand over the matter to Federal Investigation Agency (FIA). PML's legal team is now fully assured that the case will not be opened due to SC's decision of 2017. In 2018, SC's three-judge bench which consist of Justice Mushir Alam, Justice Qazi Isa and Justice Mazhar Alam dispatched a 36- page long in-depth judgement on the removal of NAB appeal by saying that NAB did not produce accused in the court or examine a single witness or evidence. The bench also noted that JIT referred the money Laundering took place in 1991-1992 but money laundering was not a crime in Pakistan till 7 Sep 2007 after the enactment of Ant-Money Laundering Ordinance and the case should be trailed in session's courts instead of accountability court. (Malik H. ,2021)

## Conclusion

The valuable conclusion that emerged from the study on issue of corruption is that it might bring basic political, economic, and institutional weakness in the country. Pakistan is a flourishing and developing state, whose economic and political health is in danger due to corruption. Corruption is an act of wrongdoing, misuse of power and authority to obtain private benefits, advantages, and privileges. Corruption has various forms, and it exists in society in various forms. It prevails in country at different levels such as at grand as well as bottom level. Today, in Pakistan corruption exists almost in every department, institution, bureaucracy and sector either in public or private. Corruption is caused due to various reasons which include poverty, lack of strong leadership, lack of strong institutions and independence of judiciary, lack of ethical and moral values as no one considers corruption as a moral crime. Another basic reason behind the advancement of corruption is the lack of system of proper punishment procedures, investigation, prosecution as well as the lack of anti-corruption laws. To prevent and counter corruption there is a strong need to form economic, political and institutional reforms which can bring peace and prosperity to countries which is necessary to counter corruption from grass-root level. The causes and symptoms of corruption should be recognized by every individual.

Immediate actions should be taken for the establishment of loyal and visible arrangements for analyzing and evaluation. If these measures are taken, the NAB's efficiency and productivity will be automatically enhanced. NAB needs to utilize all its granted powers by state and NAO for the improvement and successful prosecution of powerful and authorized citizens in the country and set a good example for the rest of institutions to follow it up. NAB must conduct the public personal experiences polls to achieve vision into its courage and fragility daily. During 2013-2018, NAB tried its best to punish the corrupt politicians but failed. In the reference of Panama Paper case, Hudaibiyag Paper case, Avenfield case and in many NAB tried it's most to punish the accused and was successful to some extent by revealing the dirty games played by the ruling politician and how they have betrayed the masses.

## Recommendations

The very first thing needed to combat corruption from society is strong leadership as the autocratic leadership in any country has a crucial role in a country's ability to wage a war against corruption. To fight corruption, tough decisions should be taken which is only

possible by the strong leaders who possess qualities like integrity, capacity of hard work and bravery there for, for strong and dedicated leadership is required to root-out corruption. The credibility of any government to punish the criminal both on claim and deliver side of corruption should be taken seriously. The ruling government should be positioned to take serious actions against those who have committed to the crime of corruption or corrupt practices. The institutions should be independent, which is a basic requirement for the smooth functioning of any government to hold accountable those in power such as politicians, bureaucrats, businessmen and other high officials. To fight against corruption, it is recommended that people should be brought to gather. To eliminate a killing disease like corruption there is a strong need to bring people from different sections to one platform which is only possible by creating awareness among the masses. A publicity campaigns are needed which teach the masses the harmful impacts of corruption in society as typical citizens have a first-hand professional with corruption and can provide the sources of corruption as well as by cooperating corruption can be minimize. Incentives should be provided for effective and enhancing corporations. Anti-corruption education should be added in curriculum and in all educational programs, from kindergarten to college. This study recommends that the corruption must be crushed from individual level by increasing awareness at root level such as school level and university level as we know students are the future of this country that's why they must educate the bad impacts of corruption and how it is damaging the progress of our country. On the other hand, Anti-Corruption Agencies and government should take initiatives to make such policies which can counter corruption as well as anti-corruption awareness campaigns on national, provincial and regional levels.

This study recommends the establishment of more institutions which can wage war against corruption. In this regard, the Federal Investigation Agency was established in the 1960s and established by the National Accountability Bureau in 1999 during the Military regime of General Pervaiz Musharraf which started the process of accountability. In 2002, the National Anti-Corruption Strategy was established with the aim of preventing capacity building, improving enforcement, and awareness. The root cause of corruption is poverty in as well as urban areas. To eliminate corruption, it is recommended to improve the economic stability of the country. A state which is economically not fixed tends to be more crooked. Introducing developmental projects, infrastructure development, providing jobs, and providing equal opportunities can minimize the intensity of corruption. A combination should be formed by the politicians, political parties, government officials, private companies, and general masses. For improving the efficiency and fairness of government to fight against corruption, new procurement such as "Public Procurement Regulatory Authority" and "Project for Improvement in Reporting and Auditing" should be initiated and encouraged and only honest and competent officers should procure for civil services. For the elimination of grand corruption, the civil servant, military official, political leaders and those in power should be investigated and prosecute by. Even the "investigative agencies" should be bringing in the light. The equality before the law should be insured. To enhance transparency and authorize the NAB, there is a need to make amendments to the National Accountability Ordinance. For instance, the Article 6 of NAO should be amended to permit liberty in selection of Chairman of NAB. In the same manner, the constitution should also be amended for the nomination of Chief Justice of Pakistan. There is a need to ensure the system of check and balance in all three divisions of government such as Legislative, Executive, and Judiciary. Lastly, the NAB should pamper all accused, offenders, and testimonies with due respect and dignity and must present the reference in accountability courts, Supreme Court or High Court. NAB should also form preventive measures through which corruption can be minimized, and peace can be brought. It is recommended that Nab should utilize its powers more effectively and comprehensively to bring the most positive results.

## References

Ahmed, A. (2022, January 25). Pakistan slides 16 spots on corruption perceptions index, now ranks 140 out of 180 countries: Report. *Dawn*.

Asif Ali, M. J. (2016). Theory and practice of understanding corruption in Pakistan: Case study of National Accountability Bureau, KPK. In D. R. Chaudhry (Ed.), *The Pakistan Development Review* (pp. 361–377).

Alecci, S. (2018). *Former Pakistan PM Sharif sentenced to 10 years over Panama Papers*. International Consortium of Investigative

Ali, Z. (2018). Anti-corruption institutions and governmental change in Pakistan. *South Asia Multidisciplinary Academic Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.4000/samaj.4499>

Badar, T. (2017, August 17). Cause of corruption. *Dawn*.

Cheema, H. (2018, July 6). How Pakistan's Panama Papers probe unfolded. *Dawn E-Paper*.

Hasan, A. (2023, December 1). Fighting corruption. *Dawn E-Paper*.

Hussnain, F. (2017, November 11). What Hudaibiya case is and how it started. *The Nation*.

Hussain, C. F. (2021, May 11). Hudaibiya Paper Mills case is story of fraud, bigger than Panama Papers case. *Radio Pakistan*.

Malik, H. (2021, May 11). Govt decides to resurrect Hudaibiya case. *The Express Tribune*.

Munir, H. (2002). National anti-corruption strategy. National Accountability Bureau.

Myint, U. (2000). Corruption: Causes, consequences and cures. *Asia-Pacific Development Journal*, 7(2), 33–58.

Naab, C. S. (2016). Free to expose corruption: The impact of media freedom, internet access, and governmental online service delivery on corruption. *International Journal of Communication*, 10, 4702–4722.

Pandhi, R. A. (2022, December 29). Overcoming corruption. *Dawn*.

Rabbani, M. I. (2005). *New millennium introduction to Pakistan studies*. Ch. Ahmad Najib Publishers.

Saleh Nawaz Khan, W. A. (2023). Why do anti-corruption agencies fail in Pakistan? A phenomenological study. *Journal of Business and Social Review in Emerging Economies*, 9(3), 181–190.

Sikander, S. (2016, November 16). Lawyer's move raises eyebrows in PML-N camp. *The Express Tribune*.

Umbreen, J. (2010). Corruption and its deep impact on good governance in Pakistan. *Pakistan Economic and Social Review*, 48(1), 123–134.

Waqas, A. I. (2023). Impact of corruption on economic growth in Pakistan: An analysis. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 4(1), 149–158.