



RESEARCH PAPER

Influence of Teacher Factors on “Quality Education” in Government Primary Schools in the Naseerabad Division, Balochistan, Pakistan

¹Shakeel Ahmed* ² Dr. Mumtaz Ali Baloch ³ Hafsa Karim

1. Lecturer, Department of Sociology, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Balochistan, Pakistan
2. Associate Professor, Department of Social Work, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Balochistan, Pakistan
3. Lecturer, Department of Social Work, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Balochistan, Pakistan

***Corresponding Author** psychology.ahmed1@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Quality education is a central issue in almost all countries across the globe. Despite its significance, quality education is influenced by various socio-economic and institutional factors in most countries. In light of this issue, this study analyzed teacher factors that influence the quality of education in government primary schools in the Naseerabad division, Balochistan. The survey research design was adopted with a sample size of 272 respondents comprised of 200 head teachers, 8 educational administrators, 32 parents, and 32 community members from the two districts in the Naseerabad division. In order to collect data from the respondents, a semi-structured questionnaire, in-depth interviews, and group discussions were used. Frequency distribution, percentage, mean, correlation, and logistic regression were used to analyze data gathered through the questionnaire. However, thematic analysis was used to analyze data collected through interviews and group discussions. The findings of the study indicate a positive association between quality education and teacher qualifications, teaching experience, teaching methods, teacher motivation, teacher training, and content knowledge. On the other hand, teacher absenteeism was negatively associated with quality education. Finally, it is recommended, among others, that appointing highly qualified and professionally trained teachers in primary school will improve the quality of education.

Keywords: Government Primary Schools, Quality Education, Teacher Factors

Introduction

Teachers are essential human resources for achieving the objectives of an educational system. In schools, teachers are responsible for the teaching-learning process. They are essential components of the educational system and incorporate highly-skilled labor resources that receive specialized training to achieve maximum results out of the classroom and classroom engagement with students (Dahar et al., 2011)

The success of any educational system depends on the quality of teachers, who, in turn, rely on an effective teaching-learning process. The role of teachers is critical for the development and proper changes in society. As a result, the quality of education is determined by the individuals who deliver it. Teachers are the cornerstones of any educational system. They play a critical role in improving the educational system as a whole and maintaining higher education standards (Javed, 2015).

Teachers significantly affect students' academic performance. They play a key role in their educational achievements because they are mainly responsible for implementing policy and turning concepts into practice during their interaction with students. (Afe, 2001). A teacher plays the most influential role in student learning by transferring the information, values, and abilities throughout the learning process. If the teacher is ineffective, the

students will make unsatisfactory academic progress under his or her guidance (Wright et al., 2018).

The Quality of education in Pakistan, particularly in Balochistan province, is adversely affected due to the poor quality of teachers. The quality of teachers and teacher education in Balochistan is far from satisfactory, and it experiences a myriad of challenges as those in the rest of Pakistan. A person is qualified to teach at the primary level after completing at least ten years of schooling and nine months of pre-service training. However, this is not usually considered in practice. Most teachers have a haphazard knowledge base and, in some cases, perform worse than their students in the same subjects, such as Mathematics, English, and Science. It has been observed that the level of education for individuals considered teachers is an issue in itself. Thus, it is no marvel that the students cannot perform well or get the required skills and knowledge that the education system expects to impart. The government needs to liaise with the international community to enhance professional development among teachers. This approach directs teachers on how to educate according to the needs of the learner and subject requirements. Countless people believe Balochistan's education system has suffered due to teachers lacking professional development opportunities (Qadir, 2020).

In light of the crucial role of teachers in education, the current research was conducted in the government primary schools in the Naseerabad division of Balochistan to examine the influence of teacher factors on the quality of education. The study analyzed quality education primarily via students' academic achievement. Students' reading, writing, and mathematical skills, as well as their examination performance, confidence level, and analytic skills, were considered the most critical indicators of academic performance.

Balochistan is one of Pakistan's four provinces, covering approximately 348 000 square kilometers. Despite being one of the largest regions in the country, it remains one of the most underdeveloped. Numerous causes have been identified as contributing to Balochistan's underdevelopment. Education in the region has lagged behind for a long time due to insufficient attention and resources devoted to ensuring that all aspects of quality education are improved. One of the eight administrative divisions within the province is Naseerabad. This administrative division consists of five districts: Sohbat Pur, Jaffarabad, Naseerabad, Kachhi, and Jhalmagsi; two of these districts (Sohbat Pur and Jaffarabad) were selected for this study. According to the 2017 census, the total population of these two districts is approximately 0.7 million.

The districts selected for the study are plagued by a variety of serious problems, the root of which is the poor quality of education. According to Balochistan Education Statistics (BES) data for 2022, there are only 849 primary schools with a Net Enrollment Rate (NER) of only 33 percent in both districts. This ratio consists of 38% males and 26% females, much lower than other regions in the province. In addition, the education department's 2019-20 annual data report indicates that primary and secondary school dropout rates in the districts of Jaffarabad and Sohbat Pur are 44% and 40%, respectively. The high primary school dropout rate is a significant source of inefficiency and resource waste in the educational system, indicating the dismal state of education in the region.

Material and Methods

The study area had 847 government primary schools, of which 200 (100 boys' schools and 100 girls' schools) were selected using simple random sampling technique. A questionnaire comprising open ended and close ended questions was used to collect quantitative data from 200 primary school head teachers. In addition, to collect qualitative data, eight (8) key informants, including the Director and Divisional Director of Education (schools), District Education Officers (DEOs), and Deputy District Education Officers (DDEOs) of the Jaffarabad and Sohbat Pur districts, were interviewed, and eight Focus Group

Discussions were held across different parts of the study area. The data provided a thorough understanding of teacher factors influencing the quality of education.

The quantitative data collected through questionnaire was analyzed using frequency distribution, percentage, mean, correlation, and logistic regression. Bivariate correlation was used to determine the relationship between the dependent and independent variables. A multivariate analysis was then conducted using logistic regression. Logistic regression was used as an analytical technique since it is the most appropriate statistical procedure when the dependent variable (i.e., quality education) is dichotomous. SPSS Version 22 was used for all analyses. Moreover, data collected through interviews and FGDs was analyzed using thematic analysis.

Factors Effecting Quality Education: Model Specification

Given the disparities in head teachers' responses to quality education in their schools, an appropriate multivariate regression analysis was deemed necessary to investigate teacher factors influencing the quality of education. As a result, a dependent variable, "quality education", was created by assigning a value of "0" to no and a value of "1" to otherwise. Given the categorical nature of the dependent variable, binary logistic regression was used to identify the factors influencing the quality of education. The regression model hypothesized that the dependent variable was associated with the independent variables X1, X2, X3 ...X9.

The model is specified as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{logit} (E[Y_1 \mid x_1, x_2, \dots, x_9]) &= \text{logit} (P_i) = \ln \left[\frac{P_i}{1 - P_i} \right] \\ &= \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_{1i} + \beta_2 X_{2i} + \dots + \beta_k X_{ki} \end{aligned}$$

Where P_i is an observed probability that determines each outcome such as $K=1, 2, \dots$ and 9 and remains specific to the outcome at hand but related to the exploratory variables.

Nine independent variables included in the regression model were the gender of the respondents (X1), age of the respondents (X2), teacher's qualifications (X3), teaching experience (X4), teacher's absenteeism (X5), teaching methods (X6), teacher's motivation (X7), teacher training (X8), and content knowledge (X9).

Results and Discussion

The data gathered through the semi-structured questionnaire, in-depth interviews, and focus group discussions were analysed using appropriate quantitative and qualitative data analysis techniques. The results were drawn and presented under the appropriate headings.

Demographic Profile of the Respondents

This section presents a demographic profile of the head teachers who responded to the survey. Table.1 shows that half of the 200 head teachers were men, while the other half were women. Based on their age, the respondents were also classified into different age groups. The respondents' ages ranged from 20 to 58 years, with an average age of 39.2 years. Teachers' teaching experience was also considered, which ranged from 3 to 28 years, with the average being 14 years.

Respondents were also categorized based on their educational level. The data revealed that majority (47.5 %) respondents had only ten years of education (Metric) to

teach at the primary school level, which was inadequate and fundamental reason for the poor academic performance of the students. Only 5% of teachers had 16 years of education (Masters). The professional qualifications of respondents were also unsatisfactory. Only 2.5% of head teachers had a Master of Education (M.Ed.) degree. It is worth mentioning that 25% of respondents had no professional degree.

Table. 1
Personal profile of the primary school head teachers

S.No.	Category	Frequency	Percentage	
1	Male	100	50%	
	Female	100	50%	
Total		200	100%	
	Minimum	Maximum	Average	
2	Age of the head teachers (in years)	.00	58.00	39.2
3	Teaching experience	3.00	15.00	14
	Category	Frequency	Percentage	
3	Masters	10	5%	
	Bachelor	30	15%	
	Intermediate	65	32.5%	
	Matric	95	47.5%	
	Total	200	100%	
4	M.Ed.	5	2.5%	
	B.Ed.	20	10%	
	CT	31	15.5%	
	PTC	94	47%	
	Nil	50	25%	
Total		200	100%	

Factors Affecting Quality Education, Results of Correlation

The correlation results show that all variables were significantly correlated with quality education except the gender and the age of the respondents. Table.2 indicates that quality education is positively correlated with teacher's qualifications ($r = 0.183$, $p < 0.01$), teaching experience ($r = 0.179$, $p < 0.05$), teaching methods ($r = 0.232$, $P < 0.001$), teacher's motivation ($r = 0.219$, $p < 0.01$), teacher training ($r = 0.223$, $P < 0.01$), content knowledge ($r = 0.148$, $p < 0.05$). On the other hand, quality education is negatively correlated with teacher absenteeism ($r = -0.144$, $p < 0.01$).

Table.2
Pearson Correlation results

Factors	Pearson Correlation	Sig.(2-tailed)
Gender	0.042	0.555
Age	0.033	0.644
Teacher's qualifications	0.183**	0.009
Teaching experience	0.179*	0.011
Teacher's absenteeism	-0.144*	0.041
Teaching methods	0.232**	0.001
Teacher's motivation	0.219**	0.002
Teacher Training	0.223**	0.002
Content Knowledge	0.148*	0.037

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

* Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

Results of Binary Logistic Regression Model

The -2 likelihood ratio (-2LL) variances for cox and shell R square and Negel Kerek R square are 72% and 84%, respectively, which indicated that the nine variables included in the model had significant influences. Moreover, the p-value for the Hosmer and Lemeshow test is greater than 0.05, indicating that this model fits the data better than any other model.

The binary logistic regression analysis results are found in table. 3. The results revealed that all variables except the gender of the respondents (OR= 1.379, $p > 0.05$) and age (OR = 1.004, $p > 0.05$) were significantly associated with quality education. The results showed that teacher's qualification was positively associated with quality education (OR=4.449, $p < 0.01$), implying that a highly qualified teacher was four times more likely to provide a high-quality education. The results also revealed that teaching experience was significantly linked with quality education (OR= 4.087, $p < 0.01$), indicating that a highly experienced teacher positively affected educational quality four times.

The results further showed that teachers' absenteeism and quality education were negatively associated (OR=0.333, $p < 0.05$), implying that teacher absenteeism three times more likely decreased the quality of education. The results also revealed a significant relationship between teaching methods and quality education (OR=4.124, $p < 0.01$), indicating that effective teaching methods increased the quality of education four times. Moreover, teachers' motivation was positively associated with quality education (OR= 2.292, $p < 0.05$), implying that a highly motivated teacher was two times more likely to provide quality education.

In addition, the logistic regression results revealed a significant relationship between teacher training and quality education (OR=3.010, $p < 0.05$), implying that a trained teacher was three times more likely to impart quality education. Similarly, content knowledge was significantly associated with quality education (OR = 2.188, $p < 0.05$), indicating that a teacher with a deeper understanding of a subject was two times more likely to provide high-quality education.

Table .3
Binary Logistic Regression Model

Variables	B	S.E.	Wald	Sig.P	Exp(B)
X1 Gender of the respondents	0.321	0.349	0.846	0.358	1.379
X2 Age	0.004	0.019	0.046	0.830	1.004
X3 Teacher's qualifications	1.493	0.469	10.120	0.001	4.449
X4 Teaching experience	1.408	0.418	11.358	0.001	4.087
X5 Teacher's absenteeism	-1.100	0.506	4.732	0.030	0.333
X6 Teaching methods	1.417	0.421	11.320	0.001	4.124
X7 Teacher motivation	0.829	0.362	5.075	0.024	2.292
X8 Teacher training	1.102	0.463	5.676	0.017	3.010
X9 Content Knowledge	0.783	0.390	4.025	0.045	2.188
Constant	-4.393	1.280	11.771	0.001	0.012

Discussion

The socio-economic and political development of any country depends on its educational system. A well-established educational system provides the necessary foundation for developing an advanced and responsible nation capable of effectively achieving its national goals. Pakistan has struggled with different educational issues since independence, and as a result, education has failed to meet the nation's objectives.

Education in Pakistan, particularly in Balochistan province, has not undergone a qualitative revolution. There are numerous issues with the education system in the province. The most important among them are the untrained and underqualified teachers. The success of any educational system depends on its teachers' quality because they are the most crucial component of every educational system. They play a critical role in the development of the education system as a whole, as well as in imparting and maintaining education standards. The study found the following significant teacher factors that affect the quality of education.

Teacher's Qualifications

The findings revealed that teacher qualifications were strongly associated with educational quality. It is evidenced in the work of Cassian, Mugo et al. (2021), whose study found that the qualifications of secondary school teachers significantly affected the quality of education. A teacher's education level influenced the effectiveness of his or her content mastery, which improved students' grades. Thomas (2012) examined the influence of teacher's qualifications on the performance of Senior Secondary School Students in Physics. The findings indicated that students taught by teachers with higher qualifications performed better than those taught by teachers with lower qualifications. Moreover, it was found that when students were taught by professional teachers, they performed better in physics.

The finding of the current study revealed that most teachers in the study area were underqualified and unable to properly facilitate the teaching-learning process, which resulted in poor students' performance and parental dissatisfaction with schools. In the districts of Jaffarabad and Sohbat Pur, 47.5% of primary school teachers had only ten-years of education, which was insufficient for teaching at this level. In addition, 25% of teachers lacked a professional qualification such as a PTC, CT, B.Ed., or M.Ed. Therefore, they lacked knowledge of the art of instruction and failed to improve students' academic performance.

Teaching Experience

The study found that teaching experience positively and significantly affected students' academic achievement. The finding agreed with Ewetan and Ewetan (2015). They examined the impact of teachers' teaching experience on the academic performance of public secondary school students in Mathematics and English Language in the Ado-Odo/ Ota and Ifo Local Government Areas in Ogun State. The results indicated a significant relationship between teachers' teaching experience and students' academic achievement in Mathematics and English Language, as evaluated by their performance in the SSC examinations and as perceived by the respondents. Moreover, schools with a more significant proportion of teachers with over ten years of experience outperformed schools with a more significant proportion of teachers with less than ten years of experience.

In the Jaffarabad and Sohbat Pur districts, 55% of teachers had less than ten years of experience. Educational administrators agreed that inexperienced teachers in government primary schools were the leading cause of the unsatisfactory performance of the education system and poor academic achievement among students.

Teacher's Absenteeism

Teacher absenteeism was a significant factor negatively associated with quality education. In the study area, teacher absence adversely impacted student learning. Due to frequent absences, course completion became challenging, leaving students with insufficient information. In the case of single-teacher primary schools, teachers' absence led to the shutdown of schools and hampered students' academic performance. Responding to the issue, participants in the focus group discussions mentioned that frequent teacher absence was the result of the ineffective school supervision and monitoring. The negative role of

teachers' unions and undue political in education compelled school administrators to refrain from penalizing absent teachers.

Teaching methods

The findings further demonstrated that teaching methods considerably influenced the quality of education. It is due to the fact that the primary objective of teaching at any level is to transfer knowledge, foster students' interests, and promote their critical thinking. To achieve these specific objectives, teachers use a variety of teaching methods. They use teacher-centered and student-centered methods most frequently. The teacher-centered method is the least practical, more theoretical, and is based on memorization (Teo & Wong, 2000). Students get knowledge from the teacher without developing an interest in the subject matter being taught (Boud & Feletti, 1999). Since it fosters students' motivation, analytical research, and critical thinking, the student-centered method is more effective than the teacher-centered method (Hesson & Shad, 2007). This approach is viewed as more successful because it does not centralize the transmission of knowledge from teacher to student. The method also promotes goal-directed behavior among students, which makes it a highly effective strategy for boosting student performance.

However, most teachers in the study area employed the traditional teacher-centered method to impart knowledge to students. As a result, students lost interest and had little understanding of the subjects they were taught.

Teacher's Motivation

The research findings also revealed that teacher motivation was significantly linked with quality education. Students' academic performance was positively influenced by a motivated teacher who encouraged them to foster their interest in their studies. In constant with this finding, Bateman (2006) found that a motivated teacher put more tremendous effort in the classroom to impart sufficient knowledge to his students to influence their behavior positively. He added that teachers' motivation remained the driving force that motivated, directed, and sustained teacher-student efforts.

However, in the study area, most teachers lacked motivation for their job because they believed their services were not socially recognized and appreciated. The government failed to recognize teachers' true worth and allocated insufficient funds for education to enhance the teaching-learning process. Lack of teacher motivation resulted in poor academic performance of students.

Teacher Training

The study found that teacher training was another essential factor that influenced students' academic performance at all levels. It improved the delivery of content in the classroom which improved students' academic performance. These findings agreed with Shah (2004), who found a direct relationship between a teacher's professional training and his students' academic achievement in school. His study found that a well-trained teacher could outperform an untrained teacher because a trained teacher is experienced in adopting new teaching strategies in class. With less time, he could educate his students more effectively.

However, most teachers in the study area lacked pre-service and in-service training and had no proper knowledge of the subjects they taught. They could not properly manage the teaching-learning process in the classrooms, which led to a decline in the quality of education and resulted in poor performance of students and parental dissatisfaction with the schools.

Content Knowledge

The study found a significant relationship between teachers' content knowledge and students' academic achievement. The findings agreed with Niess (2005). She found that content knowledge was crucial since it defined and shaped the instructional content of teachers. Therefore, there was significant evidence of a strong association between teachers' subject-matter expertise and students' academic achievement. Ishola and Udofi (2017) also concluded that a student's achievement in content knowledge was influenced more by the quality of their teachers than by their prior academic performance or the school they attended.

However, the majority of primary schools teachers in the Naseerabad division lacked subject matter expertise and a better understanding of the subjects they taught. As a result, the quality of education in terms of students' academic performance was negatively influenced.

Conclusion

Education is the most essential instrument for the advancement of humanity and the modernization of civilization. It enables students to attain their full potential as human beings and members of society by developing their characteristics and talents. Therefore, a quality education implies a focus on the improvements that the educational institution wants to see in each student, setting high expectations and assisting the student in achieving them. Teachers are essential to the quality of education because they organize instructional interactions with and between students centered on academic content, which, in an ideal environment, influences student learning. Therefore, the quality of education is dependent upon the quality of its teachers.

However, the quality of primary school teachers in Pakistan, particularly in the region of Balochistan, is very poor. Most teachers lacked the education and professional qualifications necessary to teach at the most important level of education, primary education. They needed to be regularly provided with in-service training to enhance their teaching skills and content understanding to meet the demands of the modern world. Most teachers employed the traditional teacher-centered method, which posed a significant barrier to developing students' analytical skills and critical thinking. Furthermore, inadequate school supervision and undue political interference in education encouraged teacher absenteeism, which had a negative impact on students' academic achievement.

Recommendations

Given the findings of the present study, it is recommended that the government needs to ensure that schools have an adequate number of qualified and well-trained teachers. It is essential to use unique criteria with a minimum qualification of a B.A. and B.Ed. for the appointment of primary school teachers to provide quality education and help students achieve academic success. The study found that most teachers lack significant insight, ideas, and abilities. As a result, on-the-job training programs for teachers are necessary. Untrained teachers need to be enrolled in a teaching methodology and other pedagogical skills programs to keep themselves acquainted with the current development in their field. The study also found that most of the primary school teachers are absent. Administrators need to take severe disciplinary actions against absent teachers regardless of their political affiliation or the support of teacher unions.

Excessive workload adversely affects teachers' and students' performance and contributes to disruptive conduct. The Government of Balochistan may hire enough teachers in primary schools to address this issue. Moreover, the study found that most teachers lack motivation for their profession. In order to motivate teachers, they need to get moral and

material recognition appropriate to their credentials and responsibilities. They also need to get a salary equal to other professions requiring comparable qualifications and responsibilities, allowing them to live with dignity and not be forced to take on other employment. In addition, they deserve a suitable working environment, including the technology and resources necessary for effective teaching, as well as protection in terms of health and safety.

References

- Abbas, A. (2002, December 01). The Human and Social Capital Deficit. *The News*.
- Afe, J. O. (2001). *Reflections on Becoming a Teacher and the Challenges of Teacher education. Inaugural Lecture Series 64*. Benin City: University of Benin
- Ahmad, I., Rauf, M., Rashid, A., Rehman, S. and Salam, M. (2013). Analysis of the Problems of Primary Education System in Pakistan: Critical Review of Literature. *Academic Research International*, 4(2), 324-331.
- Ahmer, M. (2003, November 25). Mafias and Education. *The News*.
- Akbar, M. (1998). *Role of private sector in expansion of primary education in Rawalpindi City*. Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad.
- Anees, M. (2001). *Future Trends and Dimensions of Distance Education in Pakistan*, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad.
- Balochistan Education Statistics*. (2021-2022). Secondary Education Department, Government of Balochistan.
- Bateman, S. (2006). Does School Integration Generate Peer Effects? Evidence from Boston's Metco Program. *American Economic Review*, 94(5), 1613-1634.
- Boud, D. & Feletti, G. (1999). *The challenge of problem-based learning (2nd Ed.)*. London.
- Casian, M., Mugo, L., & Claire, M. M. (2021). Impact of Teacher' Qualification on Students' Academic Performance in Public Secondary Schools in Rwanda. *Journal of Education*, 4(2), 75-88.
- Dahar, R.A., Dahar, R.T., Faize, F.A. (2011). Impact of Teacher Quality on the Academic Achievement of Students at Secondary Stage in Punjab (Pakistan). *European Journal of Social Sciences*, 19(1), 97-105.
- Ewetan, O. T., Ewetan, O.T. (2015). Teachers' Teaching Experience and Academic Performance in Mathematics and English Language in Public Secondary Schools in Ogun State, Nigeria. *International Journal of Humanities Social Sciences and Education*, 2(2), 123-134.
- Govt. of Pakistan. (1998). *National Education Policy, 1998-2010*. Ministry of Education, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Pakistan. (2009). *The Education Policy 2009*. Ministry of Education, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Pakistan. (2019). *Pakistan Economic Survey 2018-2019*. Finance Division, Economic Advisor's Wing, Islamabad.
- Hesson, M. & Shad, K.F. (2007). A student-centered learning model. *American Journal of Applied Sciences*, 4(9), 628-636.
- Hussain, S. (2000). *A study to compare the Elementary Education Curricula of Government and Privately Managed Institutions*. University of Arid Agriculture, Rawalpindi
- Idris, M., Hussain, S., & Ahmed, N. (2020). Relationship between Parents' Education and their children's Academic Achievement. *Journal of Arts and Social Sciences*, 7 (2), 82-92.

- Ishola, A. A., Udofia, I. G. R. (2017) Effect of demographic factors and teachers' mastery of instructional designs as predictors of pupils' achievement in mathematics. *Journal of Educational Research and Development*, 15(1), 10-24.
- Kazmi, S. W. (2005). Role of Education in Globalization; A Case for Pakistan. *SAARC Journal of Human Resource Development*, 107, 90-104.
- Modisaotsile, B. M. (2012). *The Failing Standard of Basic Education in South Africa*. AISA POLICY, Brief Number.72
- Nasser, A. Kyriazi, T., Cody M., & Ahmad, M. (2018). Impact of Identity Politics on Education in Pakistan: A Comparison between Balochistan and Punjab. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice*, 13(3), 280-294.
- Niess M.L. (2005).Scaffolding math learning with spreadsheets. Learning connections— Mathematics. *Learning and Leading with Technology*, 32(5), 24-25.
- Phillip, H. (2013). *Achieving quality education for all: Perspectives from Asia-Pacific region and beyond*. Springer.
- Qadir, S. (2020). Teachers' Perception of Professional Development at Secondary School Level: A Qualitative Study. *European Journal of Education Studies*, 9(3), 274-291.
- Rehman, S. (2009). *Seventh Workshop on Educational Planning and Management for District Education Officers*. October 22-31, 2009. AEPM, Islamabad
- Rose, A. B., Sika, J. O. (2019). Determining Influence of Teacher's Workload on Academic Performance in Secondary Schools, Suba Sub-County Kenya. *Advances in Social Sciences Research Journal*, 6(3), 287-295.
- Saqib, M. (2005, November 10). Education for All. *The News*.
- Saratulloch. (1993). *The Readers' digest oxford word finder*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Shah, D. (2003). *Decentralization in the education system of Pakistan: Policies and strategies*. Academy of educational Planning Management, Islamabad, Pakistan
- Shah, M. (2004). *A Comparative Study of the Performance of Trained Primary School Teachers with and without in-service training in Hazara Division and Development of a strategy for Future*. AIU, Islamabad. Pp.17
- Suleman, Q. (2008). Role of Educational Technology at Primary School Level in District Karak (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) Pakistan. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 1(3), 85-95.
- Suleman, Q., Aslam, H. D, Lodhi, I. & Sarwar, S. (2011). Evaluative study of the effectiveness of the administrative performance of the head teachers at primary level in District Karak (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) Pakistan. *Journal of Public Administration and Governance*, 1(2), 165-178.
- Suleman, Q., Aslam, H. D., Awan, U., Lodhi, M. A. & Hussain, I. (2012). Comparative Study of the Contemporary and Former Educational Management Systems at Elementary and Secondary Education at District Level in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Pakistan). *American Journal of Scientific Research*, 75(9), 92-116.

- Suleman, Q., Aslam, H. D., Habib, M. B, Yasmeem, K., Jalalian, M., Akhtar, Z. & Akhtar, B. (2012). Exploring Factors Affecting Girls' Education at Secondary Level in District Karak (Pakistan). *Wulfenia Journal Klagenfurt, Austria*, 19(9), 258-276.
- Tahira, M. (2020). *Teacher education in Pakistan: Issues and problems*. ERIC.
- Teo, R. & Wong, A. (2000). Does Problem Based Learning Create A Better Student: A Reflection? Paper presented at the *2nd Asia Pacific Conference on Problem Based Learning: Education Across Disciplines*, December 4-7, Singapore.
- Thomas, O. (2012). Effect of Teacher's Qualification on the Performance of Senior Secondary School Physics Students: Implication on Technology in Nigeria. *English Language Teaching*, 5(6), 72-77.
- World Bank. (2019). *Poverty in Pakistan*. World Bank Publications.
- Wright, S. P., Horn, S. P. & Sanders, W. L. (1997). Teachers and Classroom Context Effects on Student Achievement: Implications for Teacher Evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 11(1), 57-67.
- Zafar, Z. (2018) Education System of Pakistan: Social Functions and Challenges. *Journal of Indian Studies*, 4(1), 31-51.