



RESEARCH PAPER

Teacher Educators' Conceptualisation of Global Citizenship

¹Noor Hussain Shar, ²Ali Gohar Chang and ³Ayaz Latif Siyal*

1. Director Community Colleges and Schools, Sukkur IBA University, Sindh Pakistan
2. Principal, Public School Sukkur, Sindh Pakistan
3. Subject Specialist, Public School Sukkur, Sindh Pakistan

*Corresponding Author ayazlatifsiyal@ibacc.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

Adopting Interpretative Psychological Analysis (IPA) in qualitative research, this paper examines the conceptualisation of Global Citizenship (GC) by teacher educators in a public sector University in Pakistan. The research focuses on two of the three dimensions of GC suggested by UNESCO, (2015), i.e. cognitive and socio-emotional. Data was collected through semi-structured interviews. The findings reveal that teacher educators conceptualise GC in their own ways and there is no one agreed definition of it. The participants conceptualise GC as individual identity, awareness of global issues, and interconnectedness with the world. Moreover, they view a global citizen as a part of a community that extends beyond a nation-state. The participants believe that pluralistic thinking and respect for diversity and social media are enablers of global citizenship. Keeping in view a narrow conceptualisation of global citizenship this research recommends learning experience if GC education is made part of teacher education programmes in the country.

Keywords: Global Citizenship, Pakistan, Sindh, Teacher Educators, Nation-state

Introduction

This study is aimed to investigate how two dimensions of Global Citizenship (GC), as defined by UNESCO (2015) cognitive and socio-emotional, are conceptualised by teacher educators in a public sector University in Pakistan. The third dimension, i.e. behavioural dimension was not made part of this study because the purpose was to explore the conceptualisation, not the practice. The National Education Policy (2009) of Pakistan claims that "the objective of education is the development of a self-reliant individual, capable of analytical and original thinking, a responsible member of his community and, in the present era a global citizen" (p.19). As such, the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan, (2012) expects future teachers to understand the importance of interdependency among individuals and societies and the sensitivity to the environment at the local, national and global levels. The Public Sector University in Pakistan where this study was conducted introduced a department of education in 2010. The teacher educators at this university are all graduates from various public and private sector universities; some have their doctoral degrees from Pakistan and abroad: five of them have PhDs, two M.Phils, and the remaining fifteen have master's degrees in various disciplines including education. In terms of experience in the field of teacher education, mostly they are mid-career professionals. An overwhelming majority of teacher educators in this university are men and there are only two women. They teach in graduate and undergraduate programmes. The participants of the study have been working in this university for three to five years and all of them also had the opportunity to travel abroad and stay there for their studies between six months and five years, most of them in the USA and UK. Teacher educators within this university cover various concepts of GC within courses of Pakistan Studies, Social Studies and Foundations of Education to support student teachers in developing an understanding of GC within concepts like global warming, universal human rights and cultural diversity.

Conceptual framework

UNESCO, (2015) has given three dimensions of GC, i.e Cognitive dimension, Socio-emotional dimension and Behavioural dimension. This study focuses on understanding of two of these dimensions of GC- cognitive and socio-emotional-which were assessed within the teacher educators sampled for this study. The cognitive dimension is related to developing understanding and critical thinking at the local, national and global levels and about the interconnectedness of countries and peoples. The socio-emotional dimension is related to a sense of belonging to common humanity and respect for diversity. These concepts have been defined as follows:

Cognitive: To acquire knowledge, understanding and critical thinking about global, regional, national and local issues and the interconnectedness of and interdependency of different countries and populations.

Socio-emotional: To have a sense of belonging to a common humanity, sharing values and responsibilities, empathy, solidarity and respect for differences and diversity” (UNESCO, 2015).

Literature Review

Literature informs that defining GC is very complex. John (2002) for example argues that “talking about the idea of global citizenship is very difficult, indeed impossible”(p.11). Some of the proponents of GC like (Dower and Williams, 2002; and Schattle, 2008) argue that historically GC is even older than the idea of national citizenship. Many aspects of human life such as religion, trade and ideologies have always had universal implications and a scope wider than kingdoms or nation-states. According to UNESCO (2017) GC is a sense of belonging to the global community.

In Pakistan, there has been very little research on GC (Pasha 2015) but there is a plethora of literature about GC (BBC World Service, 2016; Guo, 2014; Hans, 2008; Mark, 2002; Reysen & Katzarska-Miller, 2013; Richardson & Abbott, 2009; Sharon, 2015). A notable study was carried out by Schattle (2008) using interviews to explore the practices of GC with individuals who considered themselves global citizens. The respondents were asked to talk freely and elaborate on their thinking. In that study, Schattle identified four major pathways that led individuals toward global citizenship-the power of immigration, political and social activism, educational programmes, and professional opportunities. Schattle (2008) divided GC concepts into two levels primary and secondary concepts of GC. His three primary concepts were; GC as “awareness”, as “responsibility”, and as “participation” (p.25). He concluded that the GC is no longer an abstract idea but has become tangible and people find it a meaningful concept in political, economic, social and cultural contexts. Despite the fact that the concept is considered very old, Sharon (2015) claims that the term of GC is under-theorised and he discusses its four different positions i.e. entrepreneurial, liberal humanist, anti-oppressive and incommensurable position. The context of his mapping is internationalisation in US higher education but his mapping has wider relevance. The entrepreneurial position is aligned with neoliberal approach of market economy. Liberal humanist position is related with the idea of common humanity and the anti-oppressive position is critical about the flow of power and advocates equitable distribution. The incommensurable position is critical to the claims to universalism as presented by the West.

Richardson and Abbott, (2009) highlight different sources of the three ideological tensions that globalisation has generated between GC and national citizenship in civic and social studies curricula in Canadian education. The first tension is a pedagogical tension between the transmissions of knowledge and transformational approaches of the curriculum. Richardson and Abbott believe that transformative processes are needed to

develop the dispositions relevant to GC among students. The second tension questions single perspective versus multiple perspectives of globalisation where only Western views of the world are reinforced ignoring the non-Western perspectives which diminishes the national cultures. The third tension is ambiguity between national and GC education in case of Canada where the students in civic education “are urged to take up their responsibilities and obligations to address significant global citizenship education issues” (p. 12) as citizens of Canada rather than as citizens of the world. These tensions provoke some critical pedagogical and ideological discussions which have the potential to explore the complexities of the idea of GC and its contextualisation in Pakistan.

A study carried out with Israeli secondary school teachers draws attention to how the same type of GC education differently affects students from different socio-economic sections of society: “Students are not equally ‘globalized’; students from weaker socioeconomic backgrounds do not naturally imagine themselves participating in globalized society in the future” This suggests that the underprivileged socio-economic conditions become the impeding factor, and then external facilitative factors remain less effective in changing the perceptions of individuals about the world around them and their role in it. This highlights a need to critically look into the socio-economic context of Pakistan for proper alignment of GC concepts in the curricula.

In the context of Pakistan, (Pasha 2015) asks an attention-grabbing question “whether the concept of global citizenship is valuable and appropriate for Pakistani students and whether it enables them to make sense of their role and place in the global world” (p.34). She concludes that it is important to rethink and redefine the concepts of citizenship in Pakistan from a global perspective. In her qualitative case study with the students of ninth grade and their teachers, she finds that the students developed a superficial understanding of GC and connected it with living or travelling abroad and mostly they “do not see themselves as global citizens” Pasha (2015) advocates an approach towards GC in Pakistan that creates a connection between the needs of the country and the needs of the whole world and advocates that they are not mutually exclusive. She argues that Pakistan requires “critical global thinkers who can “understand our histories, critically appreciate our interconnected present, and analytically contemplate our connected future” which seems impossible without developing such teachers who are well aware of the concept and practices of global citizenship and she highlights that the role of teacher educators is pivotal in developing such teachers. In the present crisis which the country is facing due to undaunted extremism and terrorism, climate change it is argued that global citizenship education can offer a real panacea for these ailments. With the following questions, this study attempts to investigate the conceptualisation of GC within teacher educators in Pakistan

Cognitive dimension

How do teacher educators know, understand and critically think about global, regional, national and local issues and the interconnectedness and interdependency of different countries and populations?

Socio-emotional Dimension

How do teacher educators make sense of belonging to a common humanity, sharing values and responsibilities, empathy, solidarity and respect for differences and diversity?

Data Analysis Approach

Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) was used in this study, because this approach has been suggested as the most appropriate research design for relatively small-scale studies (Alase, 2017; Jeong & Othman, 2016; Smith,) and it allows the space for all

research participants' voices irrespective of whether other participants agree or disagree. IPA approach helped to bring forward all participants' perspectives and the philosophical foundation of IPA, specifically the 'phenomenology' and the 'interpretative' found suitable for this study. The Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English defines Phenomenon as, "something that happens or exists in society, science, or nature especially something that is studied because it is difficult to understand" and Phenomenology as "the part of philosophy that deals with people's feelings, thoughts, and experiences" (Gadsby, 2003, p.1229). Moreover, meaning-making and interpretations of participants' responses make this study hermeneutic which is a "major theoretical underpinning of IPA" (Allan & Eatough, 2016, p.409). Rather the process of study was double hermeneutic as the researcher during data analysis interpreted what participants had made sense of the phenomena and expressed in their interviews (Smith, Flowers & Larkin, 2009). Moreover, my approach to analysis, giving importance to each case, gave it an idiographic approach, which is very much in alignment with IPA. The idiographic approach is concerned with the 'particular', hence the point of view of each of the participants has been given due importance in the data analysis process. This commitment to the particular established another commitment to the depth of analysis (Smith, Flowers, and Larkin 2009).

Semi-structured interviews were conducted with a sample of teacher educators. From a total population of 22 teacher educators, four participants were selected for these interviews. The semi-structured format of the interviews was chosen to facilitate the generation of rich data, which is essential for Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA). This approach allows considerable freedom in the sequencing of questions, their exact wording, and the amount of time and attention given to various topics, thus enhancing the depth and quality of the data collected."(Robson & McCartan, 2016: 290). Such interviews tend "to be the most favoured by educational researchers as they allow depth to be achieved by providing the opportunity on the part of the interviewer to probe and expand the respondent's responses".

An interview was scheduled, which piloted with a teacher educator at the same university. During piloting some questions gave an impression of repetition, they were deleted and the sequence of some questions was rearranged to facilitate the logical flow of the interview. Bailey (2007) suggests that "semi-structured interviews are usually scheduled in advance and expected to last a certain amount of time; during them, the interviewer might engage in dialogue with the interviewee, rather than simply ask questions, particularly if an interpretative or critical paradigm frames the research" (p.100). It was noticed that the probes and discussions always generated richer data and participants' points of view became clearer and realized that in IPA, "interviews do not follow a prescribed form" (Smith 2017).

In terms of the length of each interview Smith et al. (2009) suggest that "for adult, articulate participants a schedule with between six and ten open questions, along with possible prompts, will tend to occupy between 45 and 90 minutes of conversation" (p.60), similarly, the interviews in this study with 11 questions and some prompts and probes lasted for around an hour. During the interviews, the interviews were kept in an informal conversational style so that the participants were comfortable and I could carry out deeper inquiry (Dunne and Pryor 2005). All four interviews were audio recorded with the consent of the participants.

Although the piloted were interview schedule in advance, and realized during the piloting process that needed probes and small questions in between the main questions to provide more clarity about what was asking of the research participants. These probes were applied on a case-by-case basis, as the length of interviews was slightly different with different participants. Smith, Flowers & Larkin (2009) suggest that to facilitate a comfortable interaction with the participants, so that they can provide detailed accounts of

their experiences and perceptions during the interviews, a schedule for interviews should be designed in advance.

Initially recruiting participants appeared a straightforward task but as we reflected more on the practical aspects, things slowly started getting complex. Once I decided to use the IPA methodology the selection of participants became a technical concern. The sampling requirements for IPA are slightly different from other qualitative methods. Rather than sampling from a population, IPA requires the sample to represent a particular perspective. In IPA, the research questions and topic guide the selection of participants and a small sample size of the sample is preferred. The suggested sample size for the IPA method is between three to six participants (Smith, Flowers, & Larkin 2009).

With these considerations, four teacher educators were selected through purposive sampling. Cleary & Horsfall, (2014) suggest that “participant selection should have a clear rationale and fulfil a specific purpose related to research question” (p.473). In the case of this study, purposive sampling helped select teacher educators who had taught courses like Social Studies, Pakistan Studies and Foundations of Education, which include the concepts related to GC. One woman teacher educator, who taught one of these courses, was also recruited to include the women teacher educators’ perspective in the study. The guiding principles of IPA were highly useful in recruiting the right participants (Muzaffar, 2016; Muzaffar, Javaid, & Sohail, 2017).

An interview schedule was developed to address the main research question and sub-questions which included Cognitive and Socio-emotional, dimensions of GC. For IPA studies, to make the interview process clearer for the participants Smith, Flowers & Larkin, (2009) suggest that a copy of the proposed interview schedule may be given to participants ahead of the interview. Hence a copy of the interview schedule was shared with each participant in ahead of the interview so that they could provide well-thought-out perspectives.

One in-depth interview lasting 45-75 minutes was conducted with each of my four research participants. All the interviews were audio-recorded with the permission of the participants. During the interview, to ensure rich and valid data, I followed the principles listed below, suggested by (Gay, Mills, & Airasian 2012); Listen more, talk less don’t interrupt, tolerate silence, avoid leading questions, keep participants focused, follow up on what participants say, don’t debate with participants.

The process of data analysis in qualitative studies is complex (Grbich 2013) and the literature does not prescribe a definitive ‘method’ for analysis of IPA studies. However, there are suggested ways for data analysis. Keeping in mind IPA, the data analysis approach suggested by (Smith 2017) is very convincing for this study. Smith (2017) suggests that for IPA studies, “interviews are transcribed and then subjected to an idiographic qualitative analysis, looking in detail for experiential themes case by case and only then for patterns across cases” (p. 303). This drew my attention towards individual participants’ accounts as (Smith, Flowers, and Larkin 2009) suggest that in the case of IPA studies the analytic attention is towards the participants. How participants describe and make meaning is important, rather than the theories or the existing definitions of the phenomenon under study.

The data analysis process I followed used the six steps suggested by Smith, Flowers & Larkin (2009). I read each transcript multiple times and then made initial notes on the right margins of the transcript pages where sufficient space was left for the purpose of notes. This noting and coding process was not based on the questions asked or the theoretical framework but on the basis of individual participants’ responses. Then I searched for emergent themes and looked for connections in the themes. The process was repeated for all for participants’ interviews and finally, the researcher worked on the

patterns of themes across the cases. Since the IPA studies are less concerned about generalisations but each case is important, therefore every individual participant's responses got its place in the findings however, there are many convergences which are evident in the findings

Findings

The findings suggested numerous themes which include; what is GC, who are global citizens, participation and responsibilities of global citizens, and enablers of GC. These are discussed below.

What is Global Citizenship?

The notion of GC has been conceptualised by participants as a concept which is related to identity, thinking, awareness and feelings, responsible behaviours of individuals and somehow their participation in global issues.

Global citizenship as an identity

Shan (a pseudonym) believes that GC is an 'identity' different from national citizenship. In this connection, (de Rivera and Carson 2015) contend that "although local identities may be necessary for our humanity, they are not sufficient for the interdependent global identity required by our contemporary situation" (p.311). Shan a male teacher educator defines GC as a new identity:

"It's a new identity of a citizen of Pakistan, for example, to link himself or herself to the citizens of America, UK Europe. ...So global citizenship for me is something of a new identity or a mutual identity"(Shan)

A women teacher educator Sabah described global citizens in the following words. "*Global citizenship is like a quality or an identity that people ascribe to themselves or act accordingly*".

Shan and Sabah's conceptualisation of global citizenship is similar where they conceptualise it as an identity. For Shan, it is a new identity which is different from national identity, whereas Saba's interpretation of GC is simply an identity which may not be different but may be inclusive of national identity as well.

Another male teacher educator questioned the global identity, he said: "*How can an individual be a global citizen when he is already the citizen of his country? An individual can be connected with other people through social media but cannot become a citizen*" (Amjad).

Amjad had a different perspective which shows that interacting with other people does make you a global citizen, however, the idea of global citizenship goes beyond the interactions. On further probing this teacher educator said that he does not think that the actions of the citizens of one country have implications for the peoples of other countries but even this does not mean that the citizens of a country can be global citizens. This shows that the concept of global citizenship is not easily acceptable for many of the teacher educators which has implications for teacher education.

Global Citizenship as Awareness

Schattle, (2008) terms awareness as one of the primary concepts of GC. He suggests that GC is a state of mind that exists without any type of world government, passport or national ethnic identity; it is a consciousness. In terms of my research participants, Shan defined GC as awareness, saying: "*Global citizenship actually encompasses all those qualities and the awareness which students should have aaa.... about the issues which are, affecting*

everyone. Like students should be aware of how terrorism is challenging the world peace, like global warming etc.” (Shan).

Sabah also supported the understanding of GC as awareness by saying: *“It is a kind of awareness that each individual living in this world or a globe has certain rights to enjoy as well as responsibilities to fulfil”.*

This conceptualisation was more comprehensive than the identity however, it did include more details of what a global citizen should be aware about. Additionally, there was no difference in male and female teacher educators’ points of view on the. The factor awareness about the issues was highlighted by the participants in the conceptualisation of GC.

Global Citizenship as Interconnectedness with the World

Reysen and Katzarska-Miller, (2013) argue that “the world becomes increasingly interconnected; exposure to global cultures affords individuals opportunities to develop global identities” (p. 858). In terms of my participants, Sajid associates GC with connectivity and access to information at the global level. He said:

“Social media and the electronic media have played a role to make us global citizens by providing us with the information from all over the world. ... Because there is a bombardment of information,... you also know all those things which actually make you very sad, like the situation in Palestine, and famine in Sudan and Ethiopia. So, all this information is making all of us global citizens” (Sajid). “Social media is playing a central role in making us global citizens” (Shan).

“Through whatsapp and facebook, we are all the time connected with people all around the worl. For example, I can talk with my relatives in USA on a daily basis, this is making global citizen” (Sabah).

Participants emphasise that communication through social media has connected people around the world and that connectivity has made them global citizens.

Who are Global Citizens?

Pasha (2015) defines a global citizen “as an individual who is part of a community that extends beyond nation states and political affiliations to something much larger” (p.36). My participants Amjad and Sajid also had similar thoughts. For example, Amjad defined global citizen as: *“.....a kind of a person who lives in any area but he should be connected with different parts of the world through social media, media as well as he thinks like in a global perspective”.*

And Sajid had similar views: *“...with having all this information and the electronic media, the print media, and more importantly the social media, the Facebook, Twitter, LinkedIn. I think ... we are actually the citizens of a global community.*

Sabah, the only women participant, however, had a very different perspective of GC, believing that everyone who lives on the earth in any country is a global citizen. She said: *“....any individual living in this world is a global citizen. I see myself as a global citizen. Although I am a local citizen of my country, I belong to the entire world or globe”.*

Shan defined global citizen associating it with awareness: *“...somebody who is aware of the issues which are affecting not only me but also someone who is in the other part of the world”.*

Participation and Responsibilities of Global Citizens

Schattle, (2008) notes that participation is one of the primary concepts of GC. The participants of this study individually identified different ways of participation like participating in events and celebrations, using social media to discuss global issues and raising their voices against war. However such participation did not emerge as a theme among all or some of the participants. In terms of participation, however, all of the participants expressed some ways to act in environment-friendly ways. Perhaps the poor environmental conditions of the country are pushing teacher educators to think in this direction. For example, Sabah said: *"I throw all the litter in the dustbin it means that, I ... contributed to this human act, an educated act to keep the environment clean"*.

Amjad said: *"I should not add something like garbage in the environment. If I want a good environment, I should plant trees"*

Sajid shared about his responsible act in the following words: *"So I think as a global citizen it is my responsibility to have the engine of my car fixed in such a way that it does not produce harmful smoke... it will affect the global environment"*

Shan expressed his responsibility and said: *"I can personally ensure that I can plant as many trees as possible. I should avoid burning the toxic material"*.

Enablers of Global Citizens

Along with identifying themselves as global citizens and defining GC, the participants identified some of the factors that promote GC we call them as enablers of GC.

Pluralistic Thinking and Respect for Diversity

In its political meaning pluralism connotes "the toleration of a diversity of ethnic or cultural groups within a main body". Participants Sabah, Amjad and Sajid expressed in different ways how they value the respect for pluralism and diversity. For example, Sabah said: *"I strongly believe that the realisation of pluralism is very much needed. ... That will make any individual, in my opinion, a global citizen in its true sense"*.

Amjad held similar views to Sabah but related it within the workplace. He said: *"if someone is from another religion he should not be discriminated in hiring, in promotion, in respect or in any other kind of things like that"*.

Sajid considers himself connected with the people of the world because he thinks that all human being are equal and same, which is part of his belief, as he said: *"...all the human being [are] same and are equal for us and being human being we are connected with all the human being. Therefore, I feel a strong connection with all the languages, the religions, different people and places"*.

Media and Communication

Dower, (2002) believes that "the way modern technologies of communication enable forms of identity and cooperation and kinds of institutions which were not easy in the past" (p. 36). Participants Sabah, Sajid, and Shan, thought that increasing access to the Internet, social media and television have facilitated unstoppable communication and the massive flow of information. For instance, Sabah said: *"...advancement of technology internet/social media has inextricably connected almost the whole world that sitting in our hometowns we keep ourselves updated about what is happening in the entire world"*.

Sajid supported this view saying: *“This entire social media and the electronic media have played a role to make us global citizens by providing us the information from all over the world”*.

Shan also believed that television helps people to know better about different cultures, as he said: *“What will connect you with the global world is first of all television, I believe, what you see on the television you understand the culture of you know other countries...They are, they are enjoying, they are expressing the same emotions and feelings which you do”*.

Discussion

The participants' understanding of GC was expressed in terms of what they think is GC, who the global citizens are, their perceived responsibilities as global citizens, and the enablers of GC. I did not expect the participants to give an agreed definition of GC as even the literature does not provide such a definition. Rapoport, (2010) believes that the absence of a universal definition of GC has provided the space for “researchers and educators to use global citizenship and related terms loosely” (p. 180).

Participants of this study conceptualise GC as an identity that transcends national identities and boundaries and connects people from different countries, as awareness of issues that people are facing around the world and as interconnectedness among the people on the globe. In an ideological state like Pakistan where identities are mostly associated with religion and own country and even sub-national identities are discouraged, having an identity that transcends the ideological and temporal boundaries is critical. To promote a just and tolerant society in Pakistan the policy makers have to address such issues.

However, some important aspects of GC like the awareness of global issues like hunger, violence, terrorism, and illiteracy were not strongly highlighted in the participants' responses except perhaps in Sabah's account which included a discussion of issues such as illiteracy, safe drinking water, food, health and infant and maternal mortality. It cannot be generalised but in this study, the response of women teacher educators indicates a difference among the men and women teacher educators about the awareness of global issues.

Participants' conceptualisation of GC as an identity, awareness and interconnectedness highlights a responsible sense of citizenship that is aligned with the Pakistani curriculum which aims to strengthen Pakistani and Muslim identity and where other cultures are either ignored or portrayed as hostile. Pasha, (2015) suggests that policymakers need to understand that acquiring knowledge of national citizenship alone is not enough to respond the needs of increasing interdependence.

In the present world where humanity, including the people of Pakistan, are facing enormous problems related to energy, food, water, environment, disease, population, poverty, education, terrorism, and governance, sustainable lifestyles Johnson, (2013) argues “it is important to develop a global perspective which transcends or goes beyond the narrow confines of our own nation-states” (p. 453). Policymakers, the Higher Education Commission and universities need to appreciate that rather than contradicting national citizenship GC strengthens it by making learners responsible citizens who act responsibly in terms of using resources, the environment, realise their duties towards other people and build a positive image of the country of origin. To inculcate the civic sense associated with GC the role of teacher educators who prepare teachers of tomorrow play a vital role in setting the directions of education.

The participants of this research did not agree on one description of a global citizen, rather they presented three different views. For the woman participant, everyone who lives

on the globe is a global citizen, and for her, global citizenship is universal. This description indicates a political claim and provides a basis for individuals' demands and obligations for rights and responsibilities towards the globe. Sajid and Amjid on the other hand suggested a global citizen is connected with the world through social media. Doubtlessly social media is a very powerful tool to create influence on policy processes through media campaigns. However, this type of virtual participation needs to be more practical and it can be complimented with practical actions of individual citizens with a purpose to make the world a better place.

In terms of the responsibilities of GC, the participants' responses mostly remained focused on environment-related actions. Their responses indicated that small environment-friendly acts at the local level have much wider ramifications. The environment is a serious problem in Pakistan with garbage visible in almost all towns and cities, industrial contaminated water thrown into the rivers and no proper recycling facilities. Teacher educators' sensitivity towards the environment can be enormously useful by creating partnerships between schools and universities for a clean environment. Issues like illiteracy, terrorism and safe drinking water did not emerge as strong themes, which was unexpected for the researcher. This indicates a need for focused inputs on GC education in teacher education programmes in Pakistan.

Conclusion

This study explored how the teacher educators of a public sector university conceptualise GC. Although the IPA approach led me to gauge my participants' individual perceptions of GC and found that they had different opinions and perceptions from each other, I found some similarities in their responses as well. Mostly the findings do not show consensus but indicate different and interesting accounts. For example, the responses of participants present three different conceptualisations of GC, i.e. GC as an identity, as awareness and as interconnectedness. Similarly, in defining who global citizens are, the findings present three different descriptions, i.e. it is awareness of the individual that makes a person a global citizen, the second perception highlights that the people who are connected with people from other parts of the world are global citizens and the third the perception of the woman participant which considers everybody who lives on the earth as a global citizen by default. Also, the participants' responses in some cases showed consensus, such as they all were of the view that pluralistic thinking and media and communication are two major enablers of GC. Additionally, this study has done some spadework for further research that can explore how communications and social media can potentially foster GC. Researchers can further explore how GC concepts can effectively be incorporated into curricula of social studies and citizenship education in the context of Pakistan. There is also a need to study the possibilities of integrating GC education more comprehensively in the teacher education programmes in Pakistan. Researching the role of universities in developing partnerships with schools for fostering GC can also help create new avenues of university-school partnerships in Pakistan.

References

- Alase, Abayomi. (2017). 'The Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis (IPA): A Guide to a Good Qualitative Research Approach'. *International Journal of Education & Literacy Studies* 5 (2), 9–19.
- Allan, Robert, & Virginia Eatough. (2016). 'The Use of Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis in Couple and Family Therapy Research'. *The Family Journal* 24 (4), 406–14.
- Bailey, Carol A. (2007). *A Guide to Qualitative Field Research*. Second Edition. *United States: Sage Publications, Inc.*
- BBC World Service. (2016). 'Global Citizenship a Growing Sentiment among Citizens of Emerging Economies: Global Poll'. *Globescan*. London: *BBC World service*.
- Cleary, Michelle, & Jan Horsfall. (2014). 'Data Collection and Sampling in Qualitative Research: Does Size Matter?' 70 (3), 473–75.
- Dower, N. (2002). 'Global Citizenship: Yes or No?' In *Global Citizenship: A Critical Introduction*, edited by N Dower and J Williams, 30–40. *New York: Routledge*.
- Dunne, Mairear, and John P. (2005). *Becoming a Researcher a Research Companion for the Social Sciences. Conducting Educational Research*. *New York: Open University Press*.
- Gadsby, Adam, ed. (2003). *Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English: The Living Dictionary*. New ed., [Repr.]. *Harlow: Longman*.
- Gay, L. R., G. E. Mills, and P. Airasian. (2012). *Educational Research Competencies for Analysis and Applications*. 10th ed. *Boston: Pearson*.
- Grbich, Carol. (2013). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Introduction*. Second Edition. London: *SAGE Publications Ltd*.
- Guo, Linyuan. (2014). 'Preparing Teachers to Educate for 21st Century Global Citizenship: Envisioning and Enacting'. *Journal of Global Citizenship & Equity Education* 4 (1): 1–23
- Hans, Chattle (2008). *The Practices of Global Citizenship*. United States of America: *Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.*
- Higher Education Commission of Pakistan (2012). 'Curriculum of Education: B.Ed (Hons) Elementary, Associate Degree in Education'. *Higher Education Commission*.
- Imber, Mark. (2002). 'The UN and Global Citizenship'. In *Global Citizenship: A Critical Introduction*, edited by Dower Nigel and Williams John, 114–24. *New York: Routledge*.
- Jeong, Hyeseung, and Juliana Othman (2016). 'Using Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis from a Realist Perspective'. *The Qualitative Report* 21 (3): 558–70.
- John, Williams. (2002). 'Section Introduction'. In *Global Citizenship A Critical Introduction*, 11–14. *New York: Routledge*.
- Johnson, John M. (2013). 'National to Global Citizenship: Reflections on Our Values, Loyalties, and Common Future'. *Cultural Studies ↔ Critical Methodologies* 13 (6): 452–57.

- Larsen, Marianne, and Lisa Faden. (2008). 'Supporting the Growth of Global Citizenship Educators'. *Brock Education Journal* 17 (1).
- Muzaffar, M. (2016). *Educational Institutions and Political Awareness in Pakistan: A Case Study of Punjab*, Unpublished Ph. D Dissertation, International Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan
- Muzaffar, M., Javaid, M. A., & Sohail, F. (2017). Role of Pakistan Studies in Promoting Political Awareness at Secondary Level in Pakistan, *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 39(3), 57-74
- Pasha, Amna. (2015). 'Global Citizenship in Pakistan'. *International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning* 7 (1): 33-52.
- Rapoport, A. (2010). We Cannot Teach What We Don't Know Indiana Teachers Talk about Global Citizenship Education. *Education Citizenship and Social Justice* 5 (3): 179-190
- Reysen, Stephen, and Iva Katzarska-Miller. (2013). 'A Model of Global Citizenship: Antecedents and Outcomes'. *International Journal of Psychology* 48 (5): 858-70.
- Rivera, Joseph de, and Harry A. Carson. (2015). 'Cultivating a Global Identity'. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology* 3 (2): 310-30. <https://doi.org/10.5964/jspp.v3i2.507>.
- Robson, Colin, and Kieran McCartan. (2016). *Real World Research: A Resource for Users of Social Research Methods in Applied Settings. Fourth Edition. Hoboken: Wiley.*
- Schattle, Hans. (2008a). *The Practices of Global Citizenship. Lanham Rowman & Littlefield Pub*
- Hans Schattle. (2008b). *The Practices of Global Citizenship. Lanham Rowman & Littlefield Pub*
- Sharon, Stein. (2015). 'Mapping Global Citizenship'. *Journal of College and Character* 16 (4).
- Smith, A. Jonathan, Paul Flowers, and Michael Larkin. (2009). *Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis Theory, Method and Research. London: SAGE Publications.*
- Smith, Jonathan A. (2017). 'Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis: Getting at Lived Experience'. *The Journal of Positive Psychology* 12 (3): 303-4.
- UNESCO. (2015a). *Global Citizenship Education. Paris: UNESCO.*
- UNESCO. (2015b). *Global Citizenship Education: Topic and Learning Objectives. France: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.*
- UNESCO. (2017). 'The ABCs of Global Citizenship'. *United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.*