# Annals of Human and Social Sciences
## www.ahss.org.pk

**RESEARCH PAPER**

# Twitter as a Tool of Propaganda: A Discourse Analysis of Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) Twitter Propaganda on the Non-Confidence Movement

**[1]Sarmad Aftab Lashari\* [2] Ahsanullah Bhand and [3] Sajjad Gul Katohar**

1. Lecturer (Pakistan Studies) at the Department of Linguistics and Social Sciences, Begum Nusrat Bhutto Women University, Sukkur, Sindh, Pakistan
2. Youth Engagement Officer at Sewa Development Trust Khairpur Mirs, Sindh, Pakistan
3. PhD Scholar, Department of Political Science, Università degli Studi della Campania Luigi Vanvitelli, Caserta, Campania, Italy

| Corresponding Author | sarmad.aftab@bnbwu.edu.pk |

**ABSTRACT**

This study investigates PTI's use of Twitter as a tool for propaganda in political crises and highlights the potency of Twitter in shaping the political landscape in Pakistan. The use of social media as a tool for political affairs has long been applied throughout the world by different world leaders and political parties. Similarly, Pakistan is no exception. Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf's (PTI) use of Twitter as a propaganda tool during the non-confidence movement to influence public opinion and mobilize support is used as the case study. This research venture is based on the qualitative analysis of secondary sources. The information about the propaganda of PTI is sought from Twitter. The Tweets of Imran Khan have been investigated to address the core concerns of this study. Findings show that PTI's Twitter campaign employed a blend of emotional appeals, nationalistic rhetoric, and discrediting political opponents to shape narratives and control discourses. Hashtags, multimedia content, and coordinated tweet storms were instrumental in strengthening PTI's message. Thus, Twitter served as a critical platform for PTI to sustain its political narrative and counter opposition efforts. Therefore, this study recommends the formation of proper legislation for the proper use of social media to address such dangerous emerging trends in the country.

| **Keywords:** | No-Confidence Motion, Pakistan, Political Propaganda, PTI, Twitter |

**Introduction**

As social networking continues to evolve in new and significant ways, some twenty years after it first started, it has been considered a global phenomenon (Muzaffar, Chohdhry, & Afzal, 2019). Smartphones and tablets are increasingly being used to access social media, and new websites are being developed that boost online involvement. The top ten social networking sites utilized in the US, according to Delaney, social media study, are Facebook, Blogger, Twitter, WordPress, LinkedIn, Pinterest, Google+, Tumbler, My Space, and Wikipedia, 47 percent of users on these sites utilize customer support services (Delaney, 2013). The study reveals that nearly half of the users utilize social media for commercial or economic purposes to take care of clients or as customers. The popularity and reverberation effects of any new communication technology have quickly raised significant concerns. Moreover, social media instruments such as radio, television, and finally the internet all experienced the same thing. According to Allcott, the transformative phases of technology have two main effects: first, the ability to service recurrent demands better (qualitatively as well as quantitatively) and having a significant impact on the forms of social and political life. Second, social media could, however, encourage excessive participation from citizens by weakening the idea of comparability on account of the majority (Allcott, 2017).

Moreover, in the last two decades, the use of social media tools throughout the world has been increasing to strengthen political discourses and achieve political objectives. According to Facebook statistics, Indonesia ranked fourth in the world in the number of total users in 2012, behind the US, Brazil, and India (Nugroho, 2012). With 19.5 million Twitter accounts in 2012, Indonesia ranked fifth globally in terms of the number of Twitter users (Nugroho, 2012, p. 100). Social media use is enhancing civil society, and as involvement rises, it will be better able to fulfill its role as "civic custodian of the res publica." In Indonesia, new media is quickly and effectively disseminating information in the online public realm; the issue is to expand this realm to include civic and political involvement (Nugroho, 2012, p. 100).

In such a growing pace of technology, the use of social media tools in Pakistan for political purposes is not an exception. Political parties such as Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PML-N), Pakistan People's Party (PPP), and Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf have been caught using social media tools for political propaganda. In this case, Imran Khan, the leader of the Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), was losing support when the Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) proposed a no-confidence motion against him. This was because of the nation's economic unrest. Ironically, Mr. Khan's newest lifeline throughout his term has been the opposition banding together to unseat the prime. If the government's assertion that there was widespread wrongdoing or the opposition's accusation that these PTI MNAs are angry with Imran Khan are true, many Pakistanis, whether they are pro-PTI or pro-PDM, think that some form of bribery took place (Wolf, 2022). This event sparked Imran Khan's resurgence in prominence. Imran Khan promised to unveil something significant that would stun Pakistani politics during the parade ground Jalsa. The fundamental message from Mr. Khan's address was that his government was the target of an internal conspiracy on a global scale. Amid this political fiasco, the Twitter handle of Imran Khan was active in stipulating the narrative to change the mindset of people using social media tools such as Twitter and Facebook. Therefore, this study aims to understand the discourse used through the Tweets by Imran Khan on Twitter.

**Literature Review**

A range of studies have explored the use of Twitter in Pakistani politics which shed light on the strategies employed by different political actors. For instance, (Hameed, 2023; Salam-Salmaoui, 2023; Qamar, 2022; Zafar, 2016; Ahmed, 2015; Guarino, 2020; Masroor, 2019) have highlighted the use of Twitter in political affairs. Hameed (2023) and Salam-Salmaoui (2023) both highlight the role of Twitter in shaping political narratives and influencing public perceptions. Qamar (2022) further underscores the use of figurative language and religious connotations in political leaders' tweets, with Imran Khan focusing on positive aspects and targeting a global audience. Zafar (2016) provides a broader perspective, analyzing the sentiments of controversial topics on Pakistan's Twitter user base.

The work of Ahmed (2015) analyzed how political parties used Twitter during Pakistan's 2013 General Election and concluded that PTI's success was due to various factors including their use of Twitter and targeted campaigning strategies. Ahmed argues that the success story of PTI was a blend of the party riding on personality politics paradigm with a combination of an increase in voter turnout and strategized online and offline campaigning targeted at the youth. The study of Guarino (2020) provides new insights into the dynamics of propaganda networks on Twitter. It highlights the polarization and community structures within these networks, the importance of centrality metrics in detecting active users and different roles, and the dynamic nature of user clusters across different propaganda items and the whole retweet graph. However, Masroor (2019) explores how political elites use Twitter for public acclaim and ideological propagation, analyzing tweets to reveal hidden ideological structures and strategies, including the cognitive binary of self-presentation and other presentations with varying motives. In their

book Propaganda and Persuasion, Jowett and O'Donnell offer a Model of the Propaganda Process. The paradigm's seven fundamental components are the socio-historical framework, culture rim, institution, propagandists, media strategies, social network, and the public. Moreover, the propaganda model is surrounded by a social-historical environment because this context shapes how propaganda develops and responds. The infrastructure for sending and receiving communications is called the culture rim (Marková, 2008). Ideologies, mythologies, the executive branch, the economy, social norms, and events all fall under this category.

According to Markova, propaganda can, at any moment in the system, be impacted by the culture and therefore, can reflect into the culture, which is why the culture ring encompasses the whole model. The institution is at the apex of the flow model since, due to its structure and resources, it frequently acts as a propagandist. The individuals who assist the company's message in getting to the media are the propaganda agents (Marková, 2008, p. 37). They serve the institution by communicating a certain message to the intended audience. The propaganda spreads from the media to the social network, which is composed of opinion leaders, small groups of people who may contain opinion leaders and propaganda agents, and those who help spread rumors on social media. The public has greater faith in these individuals than they do in the media and institutions because the social network aids in spreading the propaganda message through those with influence in the neighborhood (Marková, 2008, p. 38). For Fischer, propaganda can be materialized through different tactics. These tactics include name-calling, transfer, testimonial, plain folk, bandwagon, card-stacking, and sparkling generalities. These are seven tactics that are frequently utilized in propaganda.

Additionally, using a disparaging or unfavorable label to lessen credibility or stir up animosity toward the topic is known as name-calling. With transference, the propagandist tries to associate the subject with the legitimacy or stature of something or someone else. A testimonial tries to enhance credibility by using an opinion leader, well-known person, or celebrity as an approval. Using the common man approach, the source tries to persuade their audience that the well-known individual or topic can connect to them. The bandwagon argument enforces the idea that since everyone else is doing it, you should persuade that person. Card stacking is a tactic that is similar to white propaganda in that certain information is omitted while other information appears to be provided. Glittering generalizations are the final propaganda tool. These are overly broad optimistic terms that everyone would accept as true or believe to be positive (Fischer, 2004).

The analysis of Bennett suggests that the capability to deploy information in methods that may grab users' interest is more valuable than content per se. Users who show interest in the material prompt the creation of fresh, interesting content. The level of political discourse is degrading every day because of emerging characters and new concerns in this technological democracy, which on the one side increases educated people and political involvement. The Internet has made it easier to disseminate political information, yet new media still raises issues with gatekeeping, agenda-setting, and structuring (Bennett, 2013).

These studies collectively underscore the significant impact of Twitter on political discourse in Pakistan, with particular emphasis on the PTI's use of the platform during the non-confidence movement. The reviewed literature illustrates that political mobilization in the advanced world and the use of new media are positively correlated. The use, effect, and distribution patterns of new media in developing nations, however, require further research. The study also investigated how Pakistani political parties used new media and how that affected the dynamics of Pakistani politics. The study focused on social media tools such as Twitter, Myspace, blogs, and email, and found that Facebook is the more popular social networking site among young people for the dissemination of political information that Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf had utilized during its propaganda mechanism.

**Material and Methods**

This study is based on the thematic analysis of secondary sources in an open-ended manner to investigate how PTI used Twitter to initiate propaganda on the non-confidence movement led by PDM. Thematic analysis can be carried out in a variety of ways and is adequately adaptable to provide for the inductive, latent, and interpretive features needed here (Ryan, 2003). Additionally, because it may be modified for usage with both written and visual content, it can mimic the experience of reading a magazine article, where both written and visual material assist the reader's interpretation of the piece's overall impact and significance (Ahuvia, 2001). These factors led to theme analysis being chosen as the best technique to answer the research issue. To collect data, the tweets from Imran Khan's official tweeter handle were selected from June 2022 to August 2022. Therefore, the qualitative approach is employed to investigate and interpret secondary sources of data.

**Results and Discussion**

**Politics and Propaganda**

By incorporating traditional public relations and political communication, political public relations are a growing area of scholarship. The main significance of this new aspect revolves around the public's examination of conveying opinions and issues to the news media. Nevertheless, the main objective of political public relations is the comprehensive utilization of media platforms to clarify specific political viewpoints, declarations, and explanations of issues to garner public assistance for political policies and election campaigns (Toledano, 2017). Due to the expanding trend of personal publications, it is important to note that those active in political public relations rarely use traditional media to reach out to and connect with their target audience. Strategic public relations may be construed as irregular or even unethical if the outcomes, while being strategic, do not primarily satisfy an organization's aims (Toledano, 2017, p. 132).

Moreover, most experts in the field of public relations such as (Heath R. L., 2001; Heath R. L., 2006; Paquette, 2015; Stewart, 2000) have emphasized that discourse is essential for building trustworthiness and ethical relationships between organizations and constituents. Kelleher and Miller also believe that Weblogs, or blogs for short, are an uprising web tool that public relations professionals are starting to take into consideration to communicate with and engage the target audience and build relationships (Kelleher, 2006).

According to Castells, norms of social engagement and multidirectional communication, which allow the public to establish and occasionally enforce their agenda in place of the agenda of the media, are what govern all interactions on Twitter (Castells, 2004). Since responses in traditional media are delayed and frequently nonexistent, communication is centered on broadcasting or unidirectional communication, which only flows from top to bottom. Since this third stage of the growth of political communication was explained, the creation of communication facilitated by social networks saw significant changes. According to Chun et al., political figures and the government utilize Twitter to boost the perception of traditional press conferences, press releases, and press notes (Chun, 2010). Additionally, they use these social networking platforms to communicate with an endless number of people. In addition, Twitter would be a useful medium for liberty of expression and neutrality. Therefore, the power of these social networking sites to alter crucial communication tactics has widely been used throughout the world.

**Twitter, Propaganda, and Dynamics in Pakistan**

Pakistani conventional media incorporate many news stories from the internet. The considerable effects of social media use on the socio-political aspects of the nation. Social

networking is becoming more popular in Pakistan, particularly among young people. According to Kugelman (2012) in Pakistan, social media is utilized as a communication tool in five different ways, to break news that hasn't been covered by traditional media and to mobilize individuals for social and other initiatives; to promote and coordinate humanitarian elements of concerns and difficulties; to mobilize activists for social reasons; and to speed up communication among politicians and their constituents (Kugelman, 2012). Due to the proliferation of television channels in Pakistan and the high level of freedom enjoyed by electronic media, viewers typically find their informational demands met by these channels. Social media is primarily used for socializing; thus, the role relies on how it is utilized. Researchers in this study looked at the frequency of false information in discussions on Pakistani politics and society on social media (Abbasi, 2021).

**The Influence of Propaganda Through Social Media in Pakistan**

Social media is having an impact on everyday people's social and political lives. Social media has given the public more power, especially considering the Middle East's unique circumstances and demographic makeup. However, because of Pakistan's unique set of conditions and demographic characteristics, it is not relevant there. Pakistani media is at its most liberated, and conventional media is actively acting as a force for change. The 'flogging video' of a girl in Swat, Pakistan, which was posted to YouTube on March 26, 2009, was quickly reported by all television news networks in Pakistan. Pakistani television channels are increasingly appropriating content from the internet and social media (Yusuf, 2013).

According to Jackson, social media has become "a crucial aspect of public discourse and communication in the present day," and it offers a completely different perspective on how individuals engage in political discourse with one another. Most politicians today actively use social media to boost political ideas and preferences as well as their public appearance and relations. From the perspective of their political objectives, politicians are now the creators of their internet-based material and interact with a much larger audience of information consumers than ever before. They have more latitude to sculpt and disseminate political messaging (Jackson, 2017). It should be done courteously and constructively, but it has been seen that the current situation is quite the reverse because social media is also used as a propaganda tool to disparage people. Societal norms and democratic principles are frequently completely ignored by politicians. In this situation, it is crucial to investigate how the politicians are creating their online personas on Twitter, the language they employ to convey their views, and the substance they are sharing. The use of Twitter by Pakistan's National Assembly members during the last democratic government served as the inspiration for the current study (2013- 2018). The MNAs are active in using critical language to paint a bad picture of others. Assembly under Pakistan's previous democratic government (2013- 2018) (Shami, 2019).

The quick uptake of social media websites has changed how people interact and communicate. On these platforms, conversations in the shape of trending topics offer a peek at events taking place in real time throughout the globe. Additionally, political efforts, public awareness initiatives, and business promotions leverage these trends. As a result, these trends are susceptible to manipulation by bad users who want to deceive the public. A technology called "Manipify" has been used to automatically identify and analyze malicious Twitter accounts. The framework is made up of three separate modules: a trend analyzer, a hashtag classifier, and a user classifier. The use of tweet content and user conduct data together with the user classifier gives a novel method for automatically identifying manipulators. The module separates users into human and automated users. The hashtag classifier then divides popular hashtags into six groups, making it easier to analyze how manipulators behave in various areas. The pattern analyzer module also looks at user behavior, hashtag reach, and linguistic characteristics of hashtags and tweets. Additionally, studies indicate that human accounts contributed more to trend manipulation than bots did.

Additionally, two case studies of hashtag wars and anti-state propaganda were provided to demonstrate how the research was applied in real-world situations (Kauser, 2021).

New media are "developing communication and information technologies through a historical phase of controversy, settlement, and institutionalization," according to **Peters (2009, p.18).** Scholars and researchers from all around the world have become interested in the Arab Spring revolt, which was promoted by the new media.

## Twitter as a Tool of Propaganda: Analyzing Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) Twitter Propaganda on the Non-Confidence Movement

This study used thematic analysis, which has two steps; the first step requires coding which means that multiple codes are selected from texts gathered from tweets. The following codes were mentioned in the tweets repeatedly, looted, corruption, fascist government, neutral, USA conspiracy, imported government, regime change, Haqeeqi Azadi (Real Freedom), rigging, Thieves, and looted money. The next step involves the generation of themes and a few themes have been generated: Anti-American sentiments, idealization of perfect state, and religious sentiments. The themes are discussed thoroughly as follows:

## Anti-American Sentiment

In Pakistan, one of the significant aspects of the Tweets mentioned is the USA conspiracy involved in the ousting of ex-Prime Minister Imran Khan. During one of the processions, he claimed to show the secret letter which can show the USA's involvement in regime change. This narrative is clearly and repeatedly shown in the Tweets. For instance:

*"Are the "Neutrals" not realizing how our beloved country is being destroyed on all fronts by the Imported govt brought in through US regime change conspiracy?" (Official Imran Khan, 20 July 2022).*

The question arises as to why the use of the USA conspiracy acted as a propaganda tool to mobilize the masses of Pakistan. The history of the Pakistan-USA relationship shows that both countries have faced many ups and downs since the independence of Pakistan. Even right after the independence of Pakistan, the then PM Liaquat Ali Khan accepted the invitation of the USA and declined the USSR invitation. Following this pattern of interdependency between Pakistan and the USA, it is interesting to note that Pakistan perceives US propaganda against it, particularly claims from Washington that Pakistan might represent a severe threat to the US, as a major contributor to anti-Americanism. Huntington's theory of the clash of civilizations would be reflected in a few Islamic nations banded together against the United States and other Western nations one day. America adheres to Western culture, but Pakistan is a component of Muslim civilization.

Both cultures have unique standards and ideals. While some standards, such as democracy, the free market, and freedom of expression, are universal, they sharply diverge when it comes to sovereignty. Consequently, this narrative of anti-American sentiments is usually used by political leaders for political attainment. The long anti-American notion constructed among the people can be gauged from the fact that around 76 percent of Pakistanis think of America as their enemy (2021). Moreover, today's Pakistanis, who make up two-thirds of the population, have experienced the most intense anti-American sentiment since 1990 in their country. Imran Khan is the most recent in a huge queue of leaders to do so to maintain their political positions. War and terrorism are the two main problems that govern the state-to-state interaction between Pakistan and the United States. To accomplish its security goals, the United States has worked directly with the military rather than civil governments. This has weakened Pakistan's institutionalization of post-colonial democracy and is a fundamental flaw in the relationship.

Politicians in Pakistan have always used anti-Americanism as a tactic to gain their political motives. Similarly, the frequent use of USA conspiracy in the Tweets also indicates one dimension of propaganda. According to the Model of propaganda, process there is always a cultural rim, and, in this case, the political environment of Pakistan has developed the animosity against USA. People, being a basic component of the paradigm of propaganda, are vulnerable to any kind of propaganda as it is already developed. The only thing is time and moment are dependent on the political leader to flare the existing cultural rim to utilize for political gains.

**Idealization of Perfect State**

It is interesting aspect that the followers of Imran Khan are mostly the younger generation of Pakistan which constitute around 60% of the population. Amid economic turmoil, lawlessness, and political unrest in the country had paved the way for the PTI to formulate government. However, these chronic issues seem not to be solved in a few years. Furthermore, when Imran Khan was ousted from his position, his Tweets regarding the old open wound of Pakistanis can be shown as one of his Tweets suggested:

"*Tomorrow evening, we will offer thanks to Allah & celebrate with all the people of Pakistan who have stood by us in our campaign for Haqeeqi Azadi, coming out in massive numbers to show support*" (26 July 2022)

In another Tweet Imran Khan stated:

"*I can say with certainty after my interaction with our nation & their response to my call for Haqeeqi Azadi that people of Pak have had enough & will not allow these mafias to continue their loot & plunder*" (23 July 2022)

These tweets can indicate propaganda by using the notion of an idealized state. First, it is important to note that Pakistan has experienced democratic and military administrations in the country. Although it was declared to be a "Democratic State" at the time, the actual situation shows that, 75 years later, it is still looking for good, strong democratic values to maintain a strong political system and political structure. Pakistan is a supposedly democratic nation, but bureaucracy, political elites, feudal nobles, organizations, and minor pressure groups sponsored by foreign powers have hijacked Pakistan's democracy (Abbasi, 2021).

Besides politics, the economy of Pakistan is also in been in turmoil. According to World Bank Pakistan's poverty at lower middle income was 39.3 percent in 2020-2021 while upper middle income has 78.8 percent (Poverty & Equity Brief Pakistan, 2021). The rate of unemployment in Pakistan is rising quickly, and it has now overtaken all other problems as the main concern for young people. Numerous young graduates from Pakistan's finest colleges are produced; however, they are unable to secure better employment.

These are cultural rims that are already formulated, have a strong basis among the people, and can act as propaganda mechanisms. Words like "Haqeeqi Azadi", "looted money", etc. signify the cultural rims which are already present. To strengthen the propaganda, similar words are frequently used to convey the real agenda to the masses. The rhetoric of the creation of an idealized state is very common among political leaders. The stress on ends over means, or on outcomes over interim steps, makes ideal theory utopian in the strong sense.

This kind of utopianism is quite evident in neoclassical economics and its political offshoot, neoliberalism, for instance: the free market is presumed to make everyone more successful in the long run, but poverty in the short run is disregarded, and the fact that only the wealthy get richer in a free market but since trickle-down is a myth is also disregarded.

On the other side of the political range, political ideologies that disapprove of tiny, incremental gains because only radical, comprehensive change is allowed exhibit a similar kind of end-state utopianism (Weber, 2017). Referring to the baseline of Pakistan's economic situation and Imran Khan's propaganda using the cultural rim only testify to the idealization of a utopian state where masses are being promised to eradicate the corruption poverty and betterment of the country. Imran Khan's political rhetoric on Twitter seems to have no connection to geopolitical realities and fantasizes about a political world that does not exist.

## Labelling the Government as a Fascist Regime

Another interesting aspect of the tweets is the labeling of the current government as fascist by Imran Khan. He has multiple times used the words "Fascist government". Here it is significant to know what exactly fascism is. According to the dictionary, fascism is a dictatorship-style political system in which there is little room for dissent and the government controls both business and labor. Nowadays, the term "fascism" is used rather loosely, frequently as an insult to disparage the politics of another person. One effect of this is that no one truly understands what the phrase still implies. Liberals view fascism as the pinnacle of conservative ideology—a totalitarian, ethnocentric, and racialized form of government centered on corporate power. Fascism, in the eyes of conservatives, is totalitarianism posing as a nanny state. There is a clear distinction between democracy and fascism so Pakistan being a democratic country is deliberating presented as the fascist country in the tweets.

## Religious Sentiments

When their associations are with the concept of power, there is a complicated relationship between religion and politics. Although both institutions place a strong emphasis on absorbing social interactions, their sources, morality, and aspirations for power differ. Since Pakistan was founded as a Muslim state, religion has played a significant part in the country's political development. Another problem is the concept of an Islamic state, which is alien to the concept of a state and sovereignty in the subcontinent because monarchical kingdoms governed by Muslim leaders in this area portray the idea of using Islam for status maintenance and the extension of personal authority. Although, the public is concerned with a description of the religion that guarantees justice and equality in the nation. Pakistan was plagued by the issue of distrust and a lack of faith in its leaders since the term "Islamization" was insufficient to address the issue. The notion of religion has been used by political leaders during the entire history of Pakistan. Similarly, this concept of using religious sentiments can be seen in the Tweets of Imran Khan where he uses Islam. For example: "*Our Prophet PBUH had said societies are destroyed when the poor are jailed while the rich are not held accountable.*" It signifies that political leaders appeal to people's religious sensibilities to gain their support to seize power through scheming, diplomacy, and attempts to earn public support whether democratically, if the structure permits it, or by usurping power with the assistance of the military, in the case of a backward and underdeveloped society.

## Conclusion

The study concludes that there was a significant amount of false news on Twitter and Facebook about politics, foreign relations, the military, the economy, and religion. Even though tales about politics and politicians were posted more frequently, those about international relations received more likes and shares than ones about other themes. It is remarkable that despite being exposed as bogus and untrue, fake news nevertheless managed to capture people's attention. This demonstrates how populism and cult following have an impact on Pakistani social media users. The study's findings corroborate existing

research on the frequency, appeal, and propagation of false information in the Western world.

The main findings of his research addressed propaganda, its various types, and tools, and its implementation through social media. The central theme of the study revolved around the use of social media tools such as Twitter and Facebook to foster propaganda against the opponent nations and political parties. The findings of the study suggested that the Imran Khan-led PTI utilized Twitter as the main social media medium to promote their propaganda against the opposition political parties and the Pakistan army.

## Recommendations

This research study suggests that the government should make proper legislation and awareness to enhance literacy about propaganda mechanisms through literacy programs. Second, social media regulations in Pakistan are weak. Due to this, misuse of social media tools like Twitter and Facebook is rampant in the country. Therefore, an enhanced and well-planned regulation mechanism can help improve the use of social media tools in Pakistan. Third, lack of transparent political communication has been an issue of almost every third world. In this case, Pakistan is no exception. The country's political communication is filled with propaganda and hate speeches. Therefore, strengthening this part can prevent the use of social media tools for targeting other political and social groups. Fourth, there is also a dearth of an intelligent social media tool that can detect propaganda-related posts and create a controlled environment. Last but not least, education about propaganda features and the positive use of social media tools should be taught at college and university levels. Doing so can help ensure transparency and smooth going of social media tools in Pakistan, and political parties such as PTI will be accountable for their misuse of social media tools like Twitter and Facebook.

**References**

Abbasi, A. (2021). Politics of Development in Pakistan: From the Post-Independence Modernization Project to 'Vision 2025'. *Journal of South Asian Development, 16 (1),* 1–24.

Ahmed, S., & Skoric, M. (2015). Twitter and 2013 Pakistan general election: The case of David 2.0 against Goliaths. *Case Studies in e-Government 2.0: Changing Citizen Relationships*, 139-161.

Ahuvia, A. C. (2001). Traditional, interpretive, and reception-based content analyses: improving the ability of content analysis to address issues of pragmatic and theoretical concern. *Social Indicators Research, 54(2)*, 139-172.

Allcott, H. &. (2017). Social Media and Fake News in the 2016 Election. *Journal of Economic Perspectives, 31(2)*, 211–236.

Bennett, W. L. (2013). *The logic of connective action: Digital media and the personalization of contentious politics.* New York: NY: Cambridge University Press.

Braun, V. &. (2006). Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology, 3(2)*, 77-101.

Castells, M. &. (2004). *From media politics to networked politics: The internet and the Network Society: A Cross-Cultural Perspective.* MA: Edward Elgar.

Chun, S. S. (2010). Government 2.0: Making connections between citizens, data, and government. *Information Polity, 15(1, 2)*, 1-9.

Delaney, D. (2013). *New Business Networking: How to Effectively Grow Your Business Network Using Online and Offline Methods.* Pearson Education.

Fischer, J. E. (2004). *Propaganda and the Internet.* Northcentral University.

Guarino, S., Trino, N., Celestini, A., Chessa, A., & Riotta, G. (2020). Characterizing networks of propaganda on Twitter: a case study. *Applied Network Science*, 5(1), 1-22.

Hameed, Z. J. (2023). Pashtun Tahafuz Movement: An Analysis of Twitter Usage During a Protest Movement. *Global Social Sciences Review*, 8(1), 396-409.

Heath, R. L. (2001). *Handbook of Public Relations.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Heath, R. L. (2006). The processes of dialogue: Participation and legitimation. *Management Communication Quarterly, 19(3)*, 341-375.

Jackson, D. (2017). *Distinguishing disinformation from propaganda, misinformation, and 'fake news'.* National Endowment for Democracy.

Kauser, S. B. (2021). *Towards Understanding Trends Manipulation in Pakistan Twitter.* Cornell University.

Kelleher, T. &. (2006). Organizational blogs and the human voice: Relational strategies and relational outcomes. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication, 11(2)*, 395-414.

Kugelman, M. (2012). *Social media in Pakistan: Catalyst for communication not change.* NOREF Report.

Marková, I. (2008). Persuasion and Propaganda. *Diogenes, 55(1)*, 37-51.

Masroor, F., Khan, Q. N., Aib, I., & Ali, Z. (2019). Polarization and ideological weaving in the Twitter discourse of politicians. *Social media+ society*, 5(4), 2056305119891220.

Muzaffar, M., Chohdhry, S., & Afzal, N. (2019). Social Media and Political Awareness in Pakistan: A Case Study of Youth, *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 3 (II), 1-13

Nugroho, Y. &. (2012). *Beyond click-activism? New media and political processes in contemporary Indonesia.* Berlin: Fesmedia Asia.

Paquette, M. S. (2015). Do the ends justify the means? Dialogue, development communication, and deontological ethics. *Public Relations Review, 41(1)*, 30-39.

(2021). *Poverty & Equity Brief Pakistan.* World Bank.

Qamar, A., Adnan, M., & Malik, Z. (2022). Political Communication of Politicians on Social Media: An Analysis of Party Leaders' Tweets in Pakistan. *Global Political Review*, VII.

Ryan, G. W. (2003). Techniques to Identify Themes. *Field Methods, 15(1)*, 85-109.

Salam-Salmaoui, R., & Salam, S. (2023). Twitter and politics: a framing analysis of Maryam Nawaz and Imran Khan's social media discourse. *Frontiers in Communication*, 8-17

Shami, S., Khan, S. N., & Ashfaq, A. (2019). Crafting political images on Twitter: Analysis of public relations strategy of politicians of Pakistan. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 56(2), 105-115

Stewart, J. &. (2000). Dialogue as tensional, ethical practice. *Southern Journal of Communication, 65(2-3)*, 224-242.

Toledano, M. (2017). Dialogue, strategic communication, and ethical public relations: Lessons from Martin Buber's political activism. *Public Relations Review, 44(1)*, 131-141.

Weber, M. &. (2017). *Political Utopias: Contemporary Debates.* University Press Scholarship Online.

Wolf, S. O. (2022). Pakistan's new government challenges. Available at SSRN 4083751.

Yusuf, H., & Schoemaker, E. (Sept 2013). The media of Pakistan. *BBC Media Action*.

Zafar, S. S. (2016). Sentiment analysis of controversial topics on Pakistan's Twitter user base. *Proceedings of the 7th Annual Symposium on Computing for Development.*